

### Prepared For: City of Fayetteville, Arkansas

GARVER GarverUSA.com

March 8, 2019



#### **Table of Contents**

Table	of Contents1
List of	Figures1
List of	Appendices2
1.0	Background3
1.1	Prior Studies
2.0	Introduction
2.1	Project Description3
2.2	Desired Objectives3
2.3	Site Evaluation Criteria3
3.0	Site Description Narratives4
3.1	Option 1 – Depot Lot – Partial Site5
3.2	Option 2 – Depot Lot – Full Site7
3.3	Option 3 – East Lot – Full Site9
3.4	Option 4 – East Lot – Partial Site11
3.5	Option 5 – Nadine Baum Studios Site13
4.0	Other Sites Evaluated15
4.1	Hillcrest Tower Site15
4.2	City of Fayetteville Lot 55 Site16
4.3	Nadine Baum Studios Site Alternate Concept17
5.0	Site Evaluation Matrix

#### List of Figures

Figure 1 - Vicinity Map	4
Figure 2 - Option 1 Depot Lot - Partial Site	5
Figure 3 - Option 2 Depot Lot - Full Site	7





Figure 4 - Option 3 East Lot - Full Site	9
Figure 5 - Option 4 East Lot - Partial Site	11
Figure 6 - Option 5 Nadine Baum Studios Site	13
Figure 7 - Hillcrest Tower Site	15
Figure 8 - City of Fayetteville Lot 55	16
Figure 9 - Nadine Baum Studios Site Alternate Concept	17

#### List of Appendices

Appendix A	Drawings:
	A1 and A2 – Option 1 Depot Lot – Partial Site Layout
	A3 and A4 – Option 2 Depot Lot – Full Site Layout
	A5 and A6 – Option 3 East Lot – Full Site Layout
	A7 and A8 – Option 4 East Lot – Partial Site Layout
	A9 and A10 – Option 5 Nadine Baum Studios Site Layout





#### 1.0 Background

#### 1.1 **Prior Studies**

The Downtown Master Plan was adopted by the City Council in April 2004 for the Downtown / Dickson Street area. In August 2005 the City and the University of Arkansas hired Martin Alexiou Bryson (MAB) to study parking in the Downtown / Dickson Street area. The study concluded that a 1,200 space parking deck was required based on the assumption that certain planned developments would occur, including the expansion of the Walton Arts Center.

Garver completed a parking deck study in November 2012 for a parking deck to serve the Entertainment District / Dickson Street area in conjunction with the Walton Arts Center Expansion. Out of four sites studied by Garver the current Spring Street Parking Deck site was recommended and a 236-space parking deck was built and was completed in October 2015.

Nelson / Nygaard, in 2016 as a part of a comprehensive Mobility Plan, completed a dedicated Parking study of the Entertainment District and Downtown area. The study offered parking management strategies and recommendations through its evaluation of parking utilization, demand for parking, and pricing for on and off-peak times. The study also examined how close certain amenities were to available parking.

Nelson / Nygaard also completed the Fayetteville Mobility Study in March 2018. The Mobility Study outlined the long-term strategy for multimodal mobility within the City.

#### 2.0 Introduction

#### 2.1 **Project Description**

This project includes the evaluation of up to five (5) potential sites within the Fayetteville Entertainment District to determine the number of parking spaces that can feasibly be contained in a future parking deck for each site. This report does not include any cost analyses of the potential parking decks.

#### 2.2 Desired Objectives

- Provide a net-gain of a minimum of 290 parking spaces.
- Parking spaces are located within 1,000-ft. of the WAC's nearest public entrance.
- A parking deck that will meet or exceed City regulations and planning requirements.
- Inclusion of Liner buildings.
- Potential for additional development.

#### 2.3 Site Evaluation Criteria

The following criteria, in no particular order of priority, are used in this report to evaluate each site.





- Deck Total Parking Spaces
- Existing Parking Spaces On-Site Lost
- Net Gain of Parking Spaces
- Number of Parking Deck Levels Required to Meet Objectives
- Existing Property Ownership of Site
- Total Square Footage Area of Liner Buildings
- Walking Distance from Deck Entrance to Nearest WAC Entrance
- Parking to Be Located Within 1,000-ft. Radius of the Nearest WAC Entrance
- Existing Structures On-Site Required to Be Demolished or Relocated
- Additional Development Potential Remaining on the Site

#### 3.0 Site Description Narratives

On January 8, 2019, Garver met with City Staff from Sustainability, Parking, and Facility Management to discuss the locations that would be evaluated for the feasibility of a parking deck. The locations chosen to be evaluated were the East Lot, Depot Lot, the Nadine Baum Studios Site, and the Hillcrest Tower Site. One alternate location was discussed at the City Public Parking Lot 55. In a subsequent meeting on February 7, 2019 with City Staff, Garver presented early concept sketches. After discussion of each site and the alternate site, a joint decision was made to further evaluate the East Lot, Depot Lot and the Nadine Baum Studios Site, including one additional variation for the Depot Lot and East Lot. A joint decision was also made to not further evaluate the Hillcrest Tower Site and City Public Parking Lot 55. More discussion on each site is included on the following pages.



Figure 1 - Vicinity Map





#### 3.1 Option 1 – Depot Lot – Partial Site

This site is located at the NW corner of the West Avenue and Dickson Street Intersection and is situated on the northern half of the site as shown in Figure 2 below and in full detail in Figures A1 - A2 in Appendix A.



Figure 2 - Option 1 Depot Lot - Partial Site

The site is currently used as a parking area for Arsaga's Coffee Shop, Chipotle Mexican Grill, the Rendezvous Hookah Lounge, and the Bank of Fayetteville (Train). The topography of the site slopes gently up from Dickson Street to the north with about 4-ft. of elevation gain from the southwest parking deck entrance to the northeast parking deck entrance. The property is privately owned.

The proposed layout of the parking deck in Option 1 is in a north-side orientation with vehicular entrances from West Avenue at the northeast corner of the deck and from Dickson Street through the existing surface parking lot at the southwest corner of the deck. The eastern and western bay of the parking deck will contain ramp up/down as identified by the U and D arrows. Pedestrian entrances are located on West Avenue at the northeast and southeast corners of the deck.

A 2- story 3,800 square foot liner building measuring 15-ft. deep is located along the West Avenue façade of the deck. The liner building is proposed to be an independent structure to the parking deck. To gain additional parking spaces the deck includes an off-shoot flat deck structure in the northwest corner. Access to the existing surface parking spaces northwest of the parking deck is maintained through the ground floor level. Option 1 displaces 105 existing on-site spaces, which requires a 4-1/2 level deck consisting of a total parking space count of 434, to achieve a net gain of 329 parking spaces.





Advantages of Option 1:

- South end of lot remains open for potential future development.
- No existing structures within the footprint of the deck are required to be removed or relocated.
- Option 1 is in close proximity walking distance to the west entrance to the WAC.

Disadvantages of Option 1:

- Existing location of dumpster between existing buildings to the west of the parking deck is blocked by the parking deck and will require relocation to an accessible location.
- The property is privately owned.
- Number of levels is 4-1/2, which places the top of the deck above existing adjacent structures.
- Visibility of Arsaga's Coffee Shop is limited.
- Off-shoot parking deck area in the northwest area of the lot has dead-end traffic circulation pattern, decreasing parking efficiency.
- Parking for the Bank of Fayetteville (Train) is impacted requiring reconfiguration of the entrance drive.





#### 3.2 Option 2 – Depot Lot – Full Site

This site is located at the NW corner of the West Avenue and Dickson Street Intersection and is situated on the entire site as shown in Figure 3 on the following page and in full detail in Figures A3 – A4 in Appendix A.



Figure 3 - Option 2 Depot Lot - Full Site

The site is currently used as a parking area for Arsaga's Coffee Shop, Chipotle Mexican Grill, the Rendezvous Hookah Lounge, and the Bank of Fayetteville (Train). The topography of the site slopes gently up from Dickson Street to the north with an elevation difference of approximately 6-ft. from one parking deck entrance to another. The property is privately owned.

The proposed layout of the parking deck in Option 2 is in a north-side orientation with vehicular entrances from West Avenue to the northwest ground entrance to the parking deck and from Dickson Street at the southwest corner of the deck. The western bay of the parking deck will follow existing grade and remain flat on the upper levels. The eastern bay of the parking deck will contain a ramp up/down as identified by the U and D arrows. Pedestrian entrances are located on West Avenue at the northeast corner and on Dickson street at the southeast corners of the deck. Pedestrian access to the adjacent commercial businesses is available through the parking deck at ground level.

An independent 2-story 4,580 square foot liner building measuring 15-ft. deep is located along the northernmost area of the West Avenue façade. The existing on-site train is proposed to be relocated as a liner building to the southernmost area of the West Avenue façade. An independent 2-story 5,160 square foot prominent liner building is proposed along Dickson Street. Option 2 displaces 113 existing onsite spaces, which requires a 3-1/2 level deck consisting of a total parking space count of 436, to achieve a net gain of 318 parking spaces.





Advantages of Option 2:

- Deck provides a significant amount of liner building space, including 2-story retail potential along Dickson Street, that is compatible with surroundings. The large presence of multi-story liner buildings help screen the deck from Dickson Street and West Avenue.
- Number of levels is 3-1/2, which blends wells with its surroundings.
- Option 2 is in close proximity walking distance to the west entrance to the WAC.

Disadvantages of Option 2:

- Existing location of dumpster between existing buildings to the west of parking deck is blocked by the parking deck and will require relocation to an accessible location as shown.
- The existing Train Bank will be required to be relocated and the existing drive thru removed.
- The property is privately owned.
- Visibility of Arsaga's Coffee Shop, Chipotle Mexican Grill, and Rendezvous Hookah Lounge is limited.





#### 3.3 Option 3 – East Lot – Full Site

This site is located at the NE corner of Spring Street and School Avenue Intersection and is situated on the entire site as shown in Figure 4 below and in full detail in Figures A5 – A6 in Appendix A.



Figure 4 - Option 3 East Lot - Full Site

The site is comprised of a City owned and operated surface parking lot to the north and two privately owned residential structures on the south. The site's topography slopes up quickly from Spring Street to the north until about mid-way through the site and then slopes down gently to the north. This variation in existing topography allows for entrances into multiple levels of the deck.

The proposed layout of the deck in Option 3 is in a north-south orientation with vehicular entrances from Spring Street on the south and from School Avenue in the northwest corner of the deck. The deck contains internal ramps on the eastern and western sides as identified by the U and D arrows. Pedestrian entrances are located at the southeast corner of the deck off Spring Street and at the northwest corner off School Avenue.

Two independent liner buildings are located adjacent to this parking deck – A 1-story 15-ft deep liner building on Spring Street with 1,115 square feet, and a 1-story 22-ft. liner on School Avenue with 3,810 square feet. The existing structure at the northeast corner of Spring Street and School Avenue is currently operating as a Bike Shop and functions as a liner building. Option 3 displaces 59 existing on-site spaces, which requires a 3-1/2 level deck consisting of a total parking space count of 390, to achieve a net gain of 331 parking spaces.





Advantages of Option 3:

- Number of levels is 3-1/2, which is compatible with its surroundings along School Avenue.
- Liner building space is provided along School Avenue and Spring Street.
- Existing bike shop on the corner is retained, which serves as a liner building.
- The parking deck takes advantage of the existing East Lot terrain offering entrances onto different levels.

Disadvantages of Option 3:

- Two existing residential structures on the south end of the site east of the bike shop will be required to be removed.
- All of the property is owned by the City except for the residential lots along Spring Street frontage.
- Option 3 has the furthest walking distance to the nearest WAC entrance as compared to the other locations.
- Residential structures are located along the east side of Shipley Alley.





#### 3.4 Option 4 – East Lot – Partial Site

This site is located at the NE corner of Spring Street and School Avenue and occupies the northern portion of the site as shown in Figure 5 below and in full detail in Figures A7 – A8 in Appendix A.



Figure 5 - Option 4 East Lot - Partial Site

As with Option 3, the site is currently used as a City owned and operated surface parking lot. The site's topography slopes up quickly from Spring Street to the north until about mid-way through the site and then slopes down gently to the north. This variation in existing topography allows for entrances into multiple levels of the deck.

The proposed layout of the deck in Option 4 is in a north-south orientation with vehicular entrances from Shipley Alley on the southeast corner and from School Avenue in the northwest corner of the deck. The deck contains internal ramps on the eastern and western sides as identified by the U and D arrows. Pedestrian entrances are located at the southeast corner of the deck off Shipley Alley and at the northwest corner off School Avenue.

One 1-story 15-ft deep liner building with 1,115 square feet is located along School Avenue. The existing residential structures and bike shop on the south end of the site would remain as liner buildings, but could also be reconfigured or replaced with new complimentary development on the privately owned property. Option 4 displaces 59 existing on-site spaces, which requires a 4-level deck consisting of a total parking space count of 389, to achieve a net gain of 330 parking spaces.





Advantages of Option 4:

- Existing bike shop on the corner is retained which serves as a liner building.
- The parking deck takes advantage of the existing East Lot terrain offering entrances onto different levels.
- Two existing residential structures on the south end of the site east of the bike shop remain.
- The property is owned by the City.

Disadvantages of Option 4:

- The parking deck will be 4 levels in order to meet parking space objectives.
- Option 4 is the furthest walking distance from the nearest WAC entrance as compared to the other locations.
- Residential structures are located along the east of Shipley Alley.
- Entrance/Exit on east side is onto one-lane alley.





#### 3.5 Option 5 – Nadine Baum Studios Site

This site is located at the NW corner of the Meadow Street and West Avenue Intersection and is bounded by Spring Street on the north. The parking deck occupies the south end of the site as shown in Figure 6 below and in full detail in Figures A9 – A10 in Appendix A.

The site is currently jointly owned by the City and the University of Arkansas. The Walton Arts Center (WAC) operates a Community Creative Center in a portion of the existing 20,000 square foot Baum Studios structure. TheatreSquared occupies the remainder of the existing structure and performs shows in a 175-seat studio type theater. As of this report TheatreSquared is in the process of constructing a new facility located east across West Avenue at the southeast corner of Spring Street and West Avenue, opening later this year.



Figure 6 - Option 5 Nadine Baum Studios Site





The site's topography variation of 6 to 10-ft. allows for multi-level entrances from the southwest corner from Meadow Street and the northeast corner from West Avenue. The parking deck is oriented east to west along the southern portion of the site. The deck contains internal ramps on the north and sounds sides as identified by the U and D arrows. Pedestrian entrances are located at the southwest corner of the deck off Meadow Street and at the northeast corner off West Avenue.

One independent 1-story, 15-ft. deep, 2,790 square foot liner building is located along Meadow Street. A 1-story, 15-ft. deep, 1,490 square foot liner building is situated inside the deck and is located along West Avenue. The northern portion of the site remains open for future potential development. Option 5 displaces 22 existing on-site spaces, which requires a 4-1/2 level deck consisting of a total parking space count of 338, to achieve a net gain of 316 parking spaces.

Advantages of Option 5:

- The parking deck takes advantage of the existing terrain offering entrances onto different levels.
- The property is jointly owned by the City and the University of Arkansas.
- Liner building space is provided along Meadow Street and West Avenue.
- Large potential development site on north end of lot.
- Existing on-site loss of parking spaces is minimal.

Disadvantages of Option 5:

- The parking deck will be 4-1/2 levels in order to meet parking space objectives.
- Removal of the existing 20,000 square foot Baum Studios structure.
- Non-traditional layout of parking deck levels, decreasing efficiency of traffic circulation.





#### 4.0 Other Sites Evaluated

#### 4.1 Hillcrest Tower Site

The north side of Hillcrest Tower was initially examined as a possible location for a parking deck as shown below in Figure 7 below.

Numerous challenges were identified for this site which prohibited further consideration:

- Obstruction of views for residents.
- Location of the loading area dock on the north side of the tower. Additional vertical clearance would be required to be provided from Meadow Street for large delivery trucks to access the loading dock thru the parking deck.
- The recently installed cooling tower equipment for Hillcrest Towers is located adjacent to the loading area in the area labeled "Existing Facilities." All levels of the deck would have to be constructed around the existing cooling tower due to the high cost of relocation of the equipment.
- Liner Buildings could not be placed along Meadow Street due to the terrain and the size of the site between the tower and Meadow Street.



Figure 7 - Hillcrest Tower Site





#### 4.2 City of Fayetteville Lot 55 Site

The existing City of Fayetteville owned Parking Lot No. 55 at the southwest corner of W. Watson Street and Campbell Ave. Intersection adjacent to the Legacy Building was initially evaluated as an alternative location for a parking deck as shown in Figure 8 below.

Numerous challenges were identified for this site which prohibited further consideration:

- Removal of existing structures on the southwest corner of the site.
- Two large trash compactors, located on the northwest corner of the site, would be required to be relocated. These trash compactors serve the Legacy Building and businesses on the north side of Dickson Street from West Avenue to Campbell Avenue.
- Liner Buildings could not be placed along W. Watson Street and Campbell Avenue due to the terrain and the size of the site.
- The existing traffic circulation from the parking lot in front of the Legacy Building to Campbell and Watson would be interrupted.



Figure 8 - City of Fayetteville Lot 55





#### 4.3 Nadine Baum Studios Site Alternate Concept

For the Nadine Baum Studios Site an alternate concept was initially evaluated. This alternate would position the parking deck to parallel the Razorback Greenway and provide 2-story liner buildings along West Avenue and a 1-story liner along Meadow Street. The total square footage of liner buildings as shown below in Figure 9 is equal to 35,340 S.F., resulting in a Net Gain of 15,340 S.F. after accounting for removal of the existing 20,000 S.F. building. This layout required a 4-level 362-space parking deck to offset an on-site loss of 22 spaces, to achieve a net gain of 340 spaces. This layout was superseded with Option 5 due to its more efficient use of space on the site resulting in the large potential development site on the north side of the site.



Figure 9 - Nadine Baum Studios Site Alternate Concept





#### 5.0 Site Evaluation Matrix

The evaluation criteria bring the potential decision-making factors together for a comprehensive comparison and are presented in matrix form below:

#### Site Evaluation Matrix

Cultural Arts Corridor Parking Deck Site Selection Study

Criteria:	Option 1 - "Depot Lot - Partial Site"	Option 2 - "Depot Lot - Full Site"	Option 3 - "East Lot - Full Site"	Option 4 - "East Lot - Partial Site"	Option 5 - "Nadine Baum Studios Site"
Deck Total Spaces:	434	436	390	389	338
Existing Spaces On-Site Lost:	105	113	59	59	22
Net Gain of Spaces:	329	318	331	330	316
Number of Levels:	4 1/2	3 1/2	3 1/2	4	4 1/2
Existing Property Owner:	Private	Private	City / Private	City	City / U of A
Total S.F. of Liner Buildings:	3,800 S.F.	9,740 S.F.+ Train	4,925 S.F. + Bike Shop	3,810 S.F.	4,235 S.F.
Walking Distance from Deck Entrance to West WAC Entrance:	516-ft.	441-ft.	605-ft.	605-ft.	700-ft.
Meets the Within 1,000-ft. Radius of WAC Nearest Entrance Criteria:	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	<ul> <li>Image: A set of the set of the</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Image: A set of the set of the</li></ul>	$\checkmark$
Existing Structures On-Site: (Yes/No) & (Demo or Relocate)	No	Yes - Relocate Train as Liner, Demo Bank Drive Thru	Yes - Demo 2 Residential Structures	No	Yes- Demo Existing 20,000 SF Structure
Additional Development Potential (S.F.)	26,900 S.F.			Possible But Privately Owned	24,250 S.F.
Summary:	5	4	3	3	6
Green - Meets or Exceeds Criteria /Definitive Site Advantage Yellow - Meets Criteria		3	5	6	Ŭ
Red - Unsatisfactory Condition					3
		3	2		3
	1		2	1	1
Preferred Option	✓			$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$

Note: All proposed parking deck options comply with the City's Height and Zoning Regulations for the Downtown Overlay Planning District.







# **APPENDIX A**

## Drawings





























