

# **Chattanooga State Community College**

## **Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President's Hiring of the Chief Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters**



**Review Conducted by**

**Tennessee Board of Regents**

**Office of System-wide Internal Audit**



## TENNESSEE BOARD OF REGENTS

### *Office of System-wide Internal Audit*

1415 Murfreesboro Road, Suite 308 | Nashville, TN 37217-2833 | Phone 615.366.4496 | Fax 615.366.1517 | [www.tbr.edu](http://www.tbr.edu)

December 15, 2014 at Noon

Mr. Tom Griscom, Audit Committee Chair  
Tennessee Board of Regents  
1415 Murfreesboro Road  
Nashville, Tennessee 37217

Dear Chairman Griscom:

Enclosed is the report for Chattanooga State Community College, *Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President's Hiring of the Chief Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters*. This report includes the review of allegations received as well as an audit of the President's expenses for fiscal year July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014, as required by Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 49, Chapter 7.

The objectives of the review were to determine the validity of allegations received, compliance with applicable laws or policies, appropriate use of the College's resources and to recommend corrective actions for any issues identified. Additionally, the objectives of the audit of the President's expenses were to comply with Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 49, Chapter 7, to determine compliance with state statutes and Tennessee Board of Regents and institutional policies regarding expenses, and to identify and report all expenses made by, at the direction of or for the benefit of the President regardless of the funding source.

This report includes an Executive Summary of the results, followed by a detailed analysis of the allegations, recommendations to improve operations at the College and schedules summarizing the expenses of the President's office.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation of the staff of Chattanooga State Community College during the review.

Sincerely,

Tammy Gourley Birchett  
Chief Audit Executive

CC: John Morgan, Chancellor, Tennessee Board of Regents  
James Catanzaro, President, Chattanooga State Community College

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President’s Hiring of the Chief**  
**Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
INTRODUCTION	1
OBJECTIVES	2
SCOPE	2
RESULTS OF THE SPECIAL REVIEW	3
<b>Section I – Hiring and Role of the Chief Innovations Officer</b>	
1. Hiring of Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer	3
2. Misrepresentation on Visa Application by College	15
3. Reorganization, New and Changed Positions, Misuse of Budgets, and Ignoring Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives	18
4. University of the West Indies and Other Innovation Initiatives	22
<b>Section II – Travel Expenses</b>	
5. Travel by the President and Chief Innovations Officer	23
<b>Section III – Other Matters</b>	
6. Claim of Nepotism	29
7. Chief Innovations Officer Car Lease	30
8. Other Issues Identified During the Review	30
<b>Section IV – Interviews to Determine Campus Climate</b>	30
<b>Recommendations</b>	32
<b>Summary of the President’s Expenses</b>	34
Schedule A – Travel Expenses for the President	35
Schedule B – Business Meals and Hospitality Expenses for the President	36
Schedule C – Other Expenses for the President	41

---

**Restriction on Use of Report**

*This report is intended solely for the internal use of the Tennessee Board of Regents. It is not intended to be and should not be used for any other purpose. The distribution of the report to external parties must be approved by the TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit and handled in accordance with institutional policies; however, this report is a matter of public record.*

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President’s Hiring of the Chief**  
**Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters**  
**Executive Summary – Page 1 of 3**

<b>President</b>	James Catanzaro	<b>Internal Auditors</b>	Blayne Clements, TBR Linda Ciprich, TBR
<b>Objectives</b>	The objectives of the review were to determine the validity of several allegations received about the hiring of the Chief Innovations Officer, travel and other matters, and compliance with applicable laws or policies. Additionally, the objectives of the audit of the President’s expenses were to comply with Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 49, Chapter 7, by performing an internal financial audit of the Office of the President for the fiscal year July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014; to determine compliance with state statutes and Tennessee Board of Regents and institutional policies regarding expenses; and to identify and report all expenses made by, at the direction of or for the benefit of the president regardless of the funding source.		
<b>Scope</b>	The scope included the allegations leading to this review for applicable periods, the expenses of the President’s Office for the fiscal year July 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014 and any additional travel costs incurred outside of that period in relation to travel to Barbados or travel by or with the Chief Innovations Officer. Testwork regarding the President’s expenses included all accounts under the direct budgetary control of the president, whether funded by institutional funds, foundation funds or external sources and other accounts as necessary.		
<b>Analysis of Allegations</b>	<p><b>1. Allegation – The Chief Innovations Officer is not qualified for the position, does not have a degree as she claims and as required by the job description and has no “true work experience.”</b></p> <p>This allegation was substantiated in part; it was confirmed that the job applicant did not have the required Bachelor’s degree as represented on her application and résumé and as required by the College’s job description for the position. Even though Duquesne University did not confer a Bachelor’s degree in 2005 because the degree requirements had not been met and no apparent changes occurred since that time, they eventually issued a Bachelor’s degree to the Chief Innovations Officer during this review, back-dated to May 2005. The College failed to verify degree and experience representations made in the employment application.</p> <p><b>2. Allegation – The Chief Innovations Officer is not a U.S. citizen and without a degree, she would have had to lie to get a work visa.</b></p> <p>This allegation was substantiated in part; based on relying on faulty information provided by the candidate in her job application about a Bachelor’s degree without validating the asserted academic credential, the President certified the same faulty information on the H-1B visa application to the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) of the U.S. Department of Homeland Security. The applicant is not a U.S. citizen, but is a citizen of Barbados. The College may sponsor individuals hired from foreign countries in the work visa process. However, the failure to verify the applicant’s degree and other missteps in submitting information for the Labor Condition Application and visa petition, placed the College at risk of penalties or greater repercussions.</p> <p><b>3. Allegation – Reorganization occurred and new positions were created so that the Chief Innovations Officer could move up. Funds have been misused from various budgets across campus, ignoring strategic plan goals and objectives. Funds have been misappropriated for travel, individual perks and unnecessary, nonexistent positions.</b></p> <p>While reorganization did occur and positions were transferred between areas, the review did not substantiate that resources were misused or misappropriated for these purposes. A reorganization plan affecting several departments was submitted to TBR for approval in April 2014, including the official title change of the Senior Executive Assistant to Chief Innovations Officer, with added responsibilities and a monthly stipend of \$1,500. Between April and November 2014, positions were moved from other areas to her areas. Of eight positions analyzed, three positions, including her position in July 2013, were from student areas. Movement of positions and related budget resources from one area to another frequently causes concern but do not necessarily indicate impropriety. The President has the ability to organize the College’s operations to meet the needs and goals of the institution. However, resources should be allocated to ensure that strategic plan goals are achieved.</p>		

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President’s Hiring of the Chief**  
**Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters**  
**Executive Summary – Page 2 of 3**

<p><b>Analysis of Allegations</b></p>	<p><b>4. Allegation – The Chief Innovations Officer was hired to develop a relationship with the University of the West Indies, however, no such relationship has been developed.</b></p> <p>This allegation was substantiated in part; even though a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) has been in place with the University of the West Indies since August 8, 2013, no programs have been established under the agreement; the five-year MOU was executed months before the Chief Innovations Officer was hired and is a cooperative agreement for institutional exchange programs with no financial obligations. The President said the relationship with the University of the West Indies is only one relationship the Chief Innovations Officer was challenged to develop.</p> <p><b>5. Allegation – The President and the Chief Innovations Officer are using state funds to travel to Barbados, Washington D.C. and other locations; this travel is more personal in nature than business, such as travel to Barbados.</b></p> <p>This allegation was partially substantiated because there was no clear business purpose for a significant portion of the Chief Innovations Officer’s first trip to Barbados from December 28, 2013 through January 13, 2014 because meetings did not appear to have been planned in advance and many individuals were not available because of the holidays; the first meeting held was on January 6, 2014. On the second trip to Barbados from July 23 through August 3, 2014, the official itinerary did not list any meetings after July 31; after discussing these August travel dates with the President on two occasions, he provided an addendum to the itinerary, that he prepared in October 2014, showing additional meetings on those dates. The review identified several trips taken by both the President and the Chief Innovations Officer, totaling \$23,263 from December 2013 through August 2014. Other travel together to Anaheim, California; Washington, D.C.; Boston, Massachusetts; and New York, New York; were trips to conferences or meetings with potential partners for the President’s planned innovation initiatives. Costs of these trips have not been questioned, but better documentation is needed for unexplained changes in schedules, resulting in additional charges.</p> <p><b>6. Allegation – Nepotism is occurring at the highest level of the administration.</b></p> <p>This allegation was not substantiated based on applying the Board’s policy. However, for one of the potential issues reviewed, it would have been better to have avoided hiring a person related to another employee in the same department. While the President approved this hiring, the TBR nepotism policy does not give presidents the authority to override the requirements of the policy.</p> <p><b>7. Allegation – The Chief Innovations Officer has a car lease paid by the College.</b></p> <p>This allegation was not substantiated. The Vice President for Business and Finance verified that the College had not paid for a leased vehicle for the Chief Innovations Officer.</p> <p><b>8. Other Issues Identified During the Review</b></p> <p>Leave Not Taken - The College’s records did not show that the Chief Innovations Officer requested and took annual leave when she traveled to Duquesne on August 29, 2014. She stated she did not use leave for the trip, seemed unaware of how the leave process worked and was not sure if she had ever used leave, although then said she thought she did use leave once. She later submitted a leave form, which was entered during the October cycle because the College does not retroactively add leave into the system.</p>		
<p><b>Questioned Costs</b></p>	<p>\$1,744.06</p>	<p><b>Recoveries</b></p>	<p>\$0.00</p>

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President's Hiring of the Chief**  
**Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters**  
**Executive Summary – Page 3 of 3**

<b>Summary of President's Expenses</b>	<p>The following is a summary by funding source of (1) certain expenses made by, at the direction of, or for the benefit of the president, and (2) salary and benefits and any other operating expenses for the president's office during the fiscal year ended June 30, 2014:</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="width: 50%;"></th> <th style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">Institutional</th> <th style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">Foundation</th> <th style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">External</th> <th style="width: 5%; text-align: center;">Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td colspan="5">President:</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Salary and Benefits</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$230,484</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$230,484</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Travel (Schedule A)</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$23,140</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$236</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$23,376</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Business Meals and Hospitality (Schedule B)</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$9,692</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$1,619</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$11,311</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other Expenses (Schedule C)</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$8,415</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$2,033</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$10,448</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Discretionary Allowance</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$4,000</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$4,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Housing Allowance</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$10,800</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$10,800</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other Allowances</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$1,800</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$1,800</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="5">President's Office:</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Salary and Benefits</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$141,359</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$141,359</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Travel</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$1,993</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$86</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$2,079</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Business Meals and Hospitality</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other Expenses</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$9,076</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$ -</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$9,076</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total Expenses</b></td> <td style="text-align: right; border-top: 1px solid black;"><b>\$440,759</b></td> <td style="text-align: right; border-top: 1px solid black;"><b>\$3,974</b></td> <td style="text-align: right; border-top: 1px solid black;"><b>\$ -</b></td> <td style="text-align: right; border-top: 1px solid black;"><b>\$444,733</b></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><b>Additional Disclosures</b></p> <p><b>Discretionary Allowance</b> - Use of the discretionary spending allowance was not included in tests performed during the audit because the President elected for the allowance to be paid as taxable income.</p> <p><b>Other Allowances</b> - The President was provided a spending allowance for cell phone of \$150 per month, \$1,800 annually, which was paid as taxable income.</p> <p><b>Vehicle</b> - The President was provided the use of a vehicle. The purchase cost of the vehicle in fiscal year FY2014 was \$33,000 (less trade in of \$16,500 and a rebate of \$3,000.) Vehicle maintenance and operating costs, totaling \$1,454 for the period, were recorded in Other Expenses. Any personal use value of the vehicle is reported to the President as taxable income.</p>		Institutional	Foundation	External	Total	President:					Salary and Benefits	\$230,484	\$ -	\$ -	\$230,484	Travel (Schedule A)	\$23,140	\$236	\$ -	\$23,376	Business Meals and Hospitality (Schedule B)	\$9,692	\$1,619	\$ -	\$11,311	Other Expenses (Schedule C)	\$8,415	\$2,033	\$ -	\$10,448	Discretionary Allowance	\$4,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$4,000	Housing Allowance	\$10,800	\$ -	\$ -	\$10,800	Other Allowances	\$1,800	\$ -	\$ -	\$1,800	President's Office:					Salary and Benefits	\$141,359	\$ -	\$ -	\$141,359	Travel	\$1,993	\$86	\$ -	\$2,079	Business Meals and Hospitality	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$00	Other Expenses	\$9,076	\$ -	\$ -	\$9,076	<b>Total Expenses</b>	<b>\$440,759</b>	<b>\$3,974</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$444,733</b>
	Institutional	Foundation	External	Total																																																																								
President:																																																																												
Salary and Benefits	\$230,484	\$ -	\$ -	\$230,484																																																																								
Travel (Schedule A)	\$23,140	\$236	\$ -	\$23,376																																																																								
Business Meals and Hospitality (Schedule B)	\$9,692	\$1,619	\$ -	\$11,311																																																																								
Other Expenses (Schedule C)	\$8,415	\$2,033	\$ -	\$10,448																																																																								
Discretionary Allowance	\$4,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$4,000																																																																								
Housing Allowance	\$10,800	\$ -	\$ -	\$10,800																																																																								
Other Allowances	\$1,800	\$ -	\$ -	\$1,800																																																																								
President's Office:																																																																												
Salary and Benefits	\$141,359	\$ -	\$ -	\$141,359																																																																								
Travel	\$1,993	\$86	\$ -	\$2,079																																																																								
Business Meals and Hospitality	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$00																																																																								
Other Expenses	\$9,076	\$ -	\$ -	\$9,076																																																																								
<b>Total Expenses</b>	<b>\$440,759</b>	<b>\$3,974</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$444,733</b>																																																																								
<b>Conclusion</b>	<p>The objectives of the audit of the expenses of the Office of the President for Chattanooga State Community College for the fiscal year July 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014 were achieved. As noted in the Analysis of Allegations section above, one trip by the Chief Innovations Officer lacked a clear business purpose for a significant portion of the trip. Tests on the President's travel indicated additional documentation is needed when changes in travel arrangements result in additional costs. Tests of remaining expenses showed that costs for travel for the Chief Innovations Officer when she interviewed for a different position before she was hired and entertainment costs reimbursed to the President while she was in Chattanooga lacked a business purpose because she did not meet the minimum requirements of the position, resulting in questioned costs of \$1,744.06. No other statutory or policy violations, material omissions from the expense reports or deficiencies in internal controls were noted over expenses. After adjustments, the supplemental schedules included with this report fairly represent the expenses of the president's office.</p> <p>The review of the allegations revealed departures from policies, guidelines and federal regulations during the hiring and work visa process. As a result of this review, several recommendations were made to address the specific issues noted in this report and to promote the efficient operation and management of the College. In beginning to address these matters, College administration should work toward creating an environment of transparency in its operations, ensuring adherence to strategic goals and allocation of resources to achieve them; requiring strict compliance with Board policies and guidelines regarding personnel actions and other procedures that ensure a fair hiring process; and evaluating the business purpose of all travel before it is authorized.</p>																																																																											

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Special Review of Allegations Regarding the President's Hiring of the Chief**  
**Innovations Officer, Travel and Related Matters**

**INTRODUCTION**

Three allegations were received from April 30, 2014 through July 7, 2014 by the Tennessee Board of Regents, Office of System-wide Internal Audit, regarding travel by the Chattanooga State Community College President, James Catanzaro with the Chief Innovations Officer, Lisa Haynes, to Barbados and other locations. Early inquiries revealed that the Chief Innovations Officer position was new to the College, with a hire date in a temporary position of November 20, 2013 and in a permanent position of December 2, 2013. Each year, the TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit selects a sample from the system's Chancellor and presidents for audits of their expenses. Because of the allegations, it was determined that Chattanooga State's President's expenses would be audited for the fiscal year July 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014, with the scope to include the travel of the Chief Innovations Officer. On July 9, 2014, the President was made aware of the complaints about travel and the upcoming audit, which was scheduled to begin that month. In July and August, additional allegations were received indicating the Chief Innovations Officer did not meet the qualifications for the position because she did not hold the degree required for the position and represented in the employment application. Various other allegations were also received during this time and are addressed in this report.

As the audit commenced and progressed, additional allegations were received about the President's administration of the College over many years. The President has been in the position since 1990. These additional concerns related to special projects initiated by the President resulting in the use of resources with little or no return; inappropriate hiring practices; and a lack of focus on student achievement and success. As applicable to the initial allegations, these issues are addressed in this report.

Of the initial allegations received, the issues surrounding the hiring and role of the Chief Innovations Officer were considered the most serious and are addressed in Section I of the report. Travel allegations along with travel expenses of the President's Office are addressed in Section II of the report. Other unsubstantiated or less significant matters are addressed in Section III of the report. Finally, Section IV includes a summary of the concerns expressed by staff during interviews to determine the morale and climate of the campus. A summary and detailed schedules of the expenses of the Office of the President for the period July 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014 are presented at the end of the report.

**Responsibilities for Operations**

The TBR System is governed by the Board of Regents, with responsibility for the operations of the System and its institutions. Their responsibility includes the employment of the Chancellor and presidents and delegation of certain powers and responsibilities to them for the efficient administration of the System and their respective institutions and programs (TBR Policy 1:02:02:00, *Duties of the Board*). The president of each university and community college in the System is

responsible for the exercise of supervision and direction to promote the efficient operation and management of the institution and the execution of all directives of the Board and the Chancellor (TBR Policy 1:02:02:00, *Duties of the Presidents and Directors*).

Within this governance structure and the directives communicated through policies, strategic plans and budgetary authorizations, along with regulatory, legislative and other requirements, Presidents have considerable responsibility to the Chancellor and the Board, while allowed flexibility in the administration of their respective institutions. The directives and external requirements establish parameters for operations, but many decisions regarding programs, personnel and other institutional matters are made at the institutional level. While some actions require approval of the Chancellor or Board, the President has the authority to make many decisions regarding institutional operations.

## **OBJECTIVES**

The objectives of the review were to determine the validity of allegations received, compliance with applicable laws or policies, appropriate use of the College's resources and to recommend corrective actions for any issues identified. Additionally, the objectives of the audit of the President's expenses were to comply with Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 49, Chapter 7, by performing an internal financial audit of the Office of the President for the fiscal year July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014; to determine compliance with state statutes and Tennessee Board of Regents and institutional policies regarding expenses; and to identify and report all expenses made by, at the direction of or for the benefit of the President regardless of the funding source.

## **SCOPE**

The scope included the allegations leading to this review for applicable periods, the expenses of the President's Office for the fiscal year July 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014 and any additional travel costs incurred outside of that period in relation to travel to Barbados or travel by or with the Chief Innovations Officer. Testwork regarding the President's expenses included all accounts under the direct budgetary control of the President, whether funded by institutional funds, foundation funds or external sources and other accounts as necessary. The review was conducted in accordance with *the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing, issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors* and included tests considered necessary in the circumstances.



## RESULTS OF THE SPECIAL REVIEW

### Section I – Hiring and Role of the Chief Innovations Officer

---

#### 1. Hiring of Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer

##### Allegations

*The Chief Innovations Officer is not qualified for the position, does not have a degree as she claims and as required by the job description and has no “true work experience.”*

##### Analysis

This allegation was substantiated in part; it was confirmed that the job applicant did not have the required Bachelor’s degree at the time of application on August 13, 2013, and while 8 years of work experience were claimed, there was no evidence the College verified the information. At the time of applying for the position of Senior Executive Assistant to the President, later changed to Chief Innovations Officer, the applicant did not have a Bachelor’s degree required by the College’s job description for the position and as represented on her application and résumé. Comparison of Duquesne University’s published requirements for the degree claimed, to the applicant’s transcript, indicates one required departmental major core course was attempted but not successfully completed. A Duquesne University official said they did not confer a Bachelor’s degree in 2005 because the degree requirements had not been met. Even though no apparent changes occurred since that time, the University eventually issued a Bachelor’s degree to the Chief Innovations Officer during this review, back-dated to May 2005. The issuance of the degree on September 23, 2014, does not change the fact that the Chief Innovations Officer did not have a Bachelor’s degree at the time of application and during the majority of the time she has worked for the College in the position.

Review of the work experience provided by the candidate on the employment application and résumé showed some discrepancies in dates and names of companies between the two documents. The applicant reported working in three businesses since leaving Duquesne in 2005, at times showing two full-time jobs. Personal ownership was not clearly stated for each company, but the Chief Innovations Officer said during the review that she did start those businesses. Even though the College’s job description required “demonstrated success as an entrepreneur,” there was no indication of the “success” of those businesses and College staff did not verify this information.

Several actions taken in the creation and hiring of the Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer position give the impression that the President had selected the candidate before the search process began. Such an approach to hiring fails to provide a fair, open hiring process and negates the purpose of the search process, which is to seek and hire the best qualified candidate. In this case, the search process appears to be an attempt to document adherence to acceptable hiring practices when the candidate had already been chosen before the position was created. The actions taken include establishing minimum requirements for the Senior Executive Assistant to the President position that mirror those claimed by the person hired; ignoring or overlooking the fact that the unofficial transcript provided did not indicate a degree had been conferred; failing to follow policy by not requiring an official transcript or independently verifying the candidate had the degree required before hiring; failing to verify the success of entrepreneurial

work experience required by the position specifications; submitting a Labor Condition Application to the U.S. Department of Labor for certification for that individual, a requirement of the visa process, before a job offer was made and two days before two of the four applicants offered interviews had been interviewed; and avoiding TBR oversight of the hiring process by not submitting the candidate, a direct report to the President, to the Chancellor for approval.

More than a month before applying for the position of Executive Assistant to the President, the applicant applied and was interviewed for another position with the College, but was not selected to fill it. The position, Associate Vice President of Leadership and Fund Development, required a Master's Degree and certain experience requirements, including fund raising experience. She and two other applicants, none of whom claimed to have a Master's degree, were interviewed along with others who did claim having a Master's degree. The College paid for her to travel from Barbados to Chattanooga from July 11 to July 13, 2013, for an interview, even though she did not meet the minimum requirements for the position. To ensure a fair and open hiring process, changes in minimum requirements after a position has been posted should result in the closing of the search and reposting of the position with revised minimum requirements.

#### *Job Requirements for Senior Executive Assistant to the President*

The President said that he hired an individual to work as the Chief Innovations Officer to work on projects to develop alternative revenue sources for the College because of diminishing state resources provided to the College. The position of Senior Executive Assistant to the President, later changed to Chief Innovations Officer, included the following minimum education and experience requirements, specified by the College, when posted and advertised from July 23 through August 13, 2013.

- At least a Bachelor's degree from a regionally accredited institution in Business, Marketing and/or Communications
- Knowledge of the cultures and educational systems of Caribbean and British Commonwealth nations
- Demonstrated success as an entrepreneur, preferably in business
- Manifestly strong language and composition skills
- Experience with publishing blogs

#### *No Bachelor's Degree as Claimed in Application*

The applicant, eventually hired as the Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer, did not have a Bachelor's degree when she applied for the position, even though it was represented to the College on the application and résumé submitted that she did have such a degree. The College's employment application includes statements requiring certification by applicants, including verification of the accuracy of the information in the application and recognition that it is a public record, authorization of a thorough background check, acknowledgement of the College's policy on affirmative action in personnel actions and understanding that false answers or statements on the application will be sufficient grounds for immediate discharge, which was followed by this statement:

I further understand that any false answers or statements made by me on this application or any supplement thereto, or in connection with the above mentioned investigations, will be sufficient grounds for immediate discharge. I understand that it is a Class A misdemeanor to misrepresent academic credentials, per TCA 49-7-133.

It should be noted that in an August 12, 2013 email, the applicant gave the College's personnel assistant permission to move the information from the first application she submitted in April 2013 for the Associate Vice President of Leadership and Fund Development to the application for Senior Executive Assistant to the President. The personnel assistant had initially emailed the applicant on August 9, 2013, offering to transfer the information because, according to the email, the President had told her the applicant was traveling. She said that they had provided assistance to applicants unable to enter data in the past for different reasons. Between the time of posting the Associate Vice President position in April 2013 and the posting of the Senior Executive Assistant position in July 2013, the online application system had been upgraded, requiring the information to be re-entered. Once completed, the personnel assistant emailed the applicant the application on August 13, with a request for her to send her any changes to the information. The personnel assistant said that she also checked the box and inserted the initials of the applicant, indicating agreement and certification of the statements referenced above. The applicant responded to the assistant on August 15 regarding scheduling a Skype interview and referenced the application but did not indicate any changes were needed.

#### *Failure to Obtain Official Transcript or Validate Degree*

Chattanooga State's Office of Human Resources, after being provided an unofficial transcript by the applicant, did not require that she provide an official transcript during the hiring process, nor did they attempt to verify the degree called for in their job description by contacting the University or through a clearinghouse. In addition, the unofficial transcript did not state that a degree had been conferred, which should have alerted College staff involved in the hiring that additional procedures were necessary to verify the degree asserted by the applicant.

A staff member in Human Resources said that she had asked the employee for the official transcript more than once, but there were no records of these requests. Once the transcript was requested during this review in August 2014, the staff member did send two emails to the employee requesting the official transcript. The Director of Human Resources said that the Chief Innovations Officer told him that she could not get an official transcript because she had an outstanding financial obligation to the University, which she later confirmed in an interview. The President said he had personally reviewed the unofficial transcript provided during the hiring process and determined that the candidate had completed all of the requirements based on the current degree requirements of the University.

TBR's Guideline P-010, Personnel Transactions and Recommended Forms, Section I, Part D, establishes minimum requirements for all system appointments. In relation to verification of information provided by a candidate during the application process, it states, "The Tennessee Board of Regents believes that it is important to check references to limit employer liability, verify information and reduce costs of rehiring and retraining. Checks will produce authenticity of information as it relates to such areas as work history, credential problems and criminal backgrounds.

Each campus shall conduct appropriate and timely checks in conjunction with each employment offer.”

In addition, the College’s Search Committee Guidelines state that Human Resources is responsible for “ensuring that all documentation related to the search is collected and maintained in the online employment system for two years (per TBR policy)” and requires that:

Online applications must include a Chattanooga State employment application and other documents (transcripts, license/certification, cover letter, etc.) as indicated on the job posting. Applicants for a position requiring a College degree (Associate, Bachelor’s, Master’s, or Doctorate) must submit a transcript indicating the degree awarded. An unofficial transcript will be accepted online for review purposes. However, original transcripts are required if the candidate is hired for the position.

*Comparison of Published Degree Requirements to Transcripts*

The unofficial transcript from Duquesne University, dated 2011 and provided by the candidate to the College, shows that the Chief Innovations Officer attended from Spring semester of 2001 through the Spring semester of 2005. The unofficial transcript shows she transferred in 6 hours from the Academy of West Indies, earned 124 credit hours at Duquesne and had 130 hours in total at the end of the Spring 2005 term. But the unofficial transcript does not state a degree was earned. According to Duquesne’s published requirements, a Bachelor of Arts degree in the Communications Studies program required 120 credit hours, but also included specific course requirements including 5 core courses for a Department of Communications major and 4 writing-intensive courses. The transcript shows that the Chief Innovations Officer attempted one of the five departmental core courses required for this program of study three times (Spring semesters in 2003, 2004 and 2005); the third attempt in her last semester was the only course taken that semester. The course, Communications 301W, *History of Communications*, was not successfully completed.

A comparison of the Duquesne University requirements for the Bachelor of Arts degree in Communications Studies shows that the requirements were not met based on comparing the University’s published catalog requirements for the program of study to the unofficial transcript and the recently provided official transcript of the Chief Innovations Officer. In the schedule on the following page, University catalogs used were for the years she began her study (2000-2001), her last semester of attendance (2004-2005), and the current catalog online (2014-2015). In addition to the program requirements, the catalog for each period requires that a candidate for a degree must have satisfied all financial obligations to the University; the Chief Innovations Officer confirmed during the review that she had an outstanding financial obligation to the University.

**Comparison of Duquesne University Catalog Requirements  
for Bachelor of Arts in Communication Studies to Transcripts**

<b>Catalog</b>	<b>Page #</b>	<b>Program Requirement</b>	<b>Completed per Transcript</b>
2000-2001	27	All University majors – minimum of 4 Writing Intensive courses	Yes
2004-2005	34	All University majors – minimum of 4 Writing Intensive courses	Yes
2014-2015	Online	All University majors – minimum of 4 Writing Intensive courses	Yes
2000-2001	49	5 Core Courses required for the Dept of Communications Majors including COMM 301W	No – 4 of 5
2004-2005	62	5 Core Courses required for the Dept of Communications Majors including COMM 301W	No – 4 of 5
2014-2015	Online	Required Core (6 credits) No matter which major they choose in Communication & Rhetorical Studies, students will understand themselves as part of history and strive to be ethical communicators. All B.A. students in Communication & Rhetorical Studies take the following courses: COMM 301W History of Communication COMM 494W Communication Ethics	No – 301W was not completed

*Communications with Duquesne University Regarding Degree*

After requests for the official transcript by the TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit and by Human Resources to the Chief Innovations Officer in August 2014, the employee traveled to Duquesne University in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania on August 29, 2014. As part of this review, inquiries were also made of Duquesne University by TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit to validate whether the employee was conferred a Bachelor of Arts degree in Communications Studies, as she asserted in her employment application and required by the College for the position. Even though catalog requirements for the program of study and initial inquiries of the University confirmed a degree had not been conferred and statements were made by Duquesne officials that one could not be conferred until December 2014 at the earliest, the University ultimately provided a letter to the Chattanooga State President on September 23, 2014, stating they were awarding a Bachelor of Arts Degree in Communication Studies to the employee effective Spring 2005. Provision of the back-dated degree occurred after several events, including those summarized below.

**September 4 and 5, 2014** – Two initial calls to the Registrar’s Office by TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit confirmed that a degree had not been conferred to the employee.

**September 9, 2014** – Results of the degree analysis referenced above and confirmations by Duquesne were relayed to the Chattanooga State President. In this discussion, the President stated that the auditor should have a “more enlightened view” of degrees and downplayed their importance by referencing several successful entrepreneurs that do not have a college degree. It was pointed out that the College wrote the job description, which required the degree. He also stated that Duquesne was to provide a letter to Chattanooga State regarding the degree.

**September 9, 2014** – Later on this day, the President forwarded a letter addressed to him, from the Duquesne University Dean of the McAnulty College, dated August 29, 2014. The letter confirmed a degree had not been conferred, but it stated the Chief Innovations Officer “earned sufficient credits for her degree as of December, 2005” and has “completed her course of study in Integrated Marketing Communication ... with a minor in Marketing.” He also indicated that once the balance on her account was paid, they will be able to issue the “formal paperwork.”

On her résumé, the applicant listed her degree as “B. A. in Communications Studies” followed by a concentration in “Integrated Marketing Communication.” On her employment application, she listed a Bachelor’s degree in “Business Studies + Integrated Marketing Communications.” The unofficial transcript lists the academic program as a Bachelor of Arts with a Major in “Communication Studies” and a Minor in “General Business.” According to the University’s catalogs, the first academic year that a Bachelor’s degree in Integrated Marketing Communication was offered was 2005 – 2006. The information provided in this letter did not provide the resolution sought because it referenced a different date and programs than were indicated by the unofficial transcript.

Also on this date, the TBR System-wide Internal Audit Investigator received a call and email from the Director of University Core Curriculum/Undergraduate Director at Duquesne, who had been copied on the Dean’s letter to the Chattanooga State President. The Director did not disagree that the departmental core course requirement had not been met. She stated that course requirements could be substituted by another course or waived on a case-by-case basis. However, she never stated whether a course had been substituted for the departmental core requirement, COMM 301W, *History of Communication* or the requirement had been waived in this case.

**September 18, 2014** – To attempt to clarify the information observed and received about the degree, including the discrepancy noted in the degree requirements compared to the transcripts, the date the degree had been earned as stated in the Dean’s letter compared to the date of last attendance in the unofficial transcript and the program of study for the bachelor’s degree, TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit sent a request to the Duquesne University Registrar for additional information.

**September 19, 2014** – The University’s Provost sent a letter to TBR Internal Audit stating the earliest a degree could be conferred to the Chief Innovations Officer was December 2014, if the outstanding financial obligation was resolved. The Provost made the following additional points in this correspondence:

- While attending the University, she pursued two courses of study, a major in Communication Studies (with an “emphasis” in Integrated Marketing Communication) and a minor in Marketing.
- Having sufficient hours to satisfy the requirements for both programs, she applied for the May 2005 commencement and crossed the stage.
- “Clearing” students for degrees continues after Commencement. In this case, the department-level audit determined that a specific curricular requirement for the Communication Studies major had not been satisfied. This outcome became a matter of official record.

- Nothing in their files indicates she was notified of this turn of events, but she could not have expected to receive a diploma or transcript in the near term since a financial balance had not been satisfied. As a result, she had no reason to file an appeal.
- Only when she returned to Duquesne on August 29, 2014, to obtain her diploma, did she learn her degree had never been conferred.
- Meeting with Department of Communication staff, her academic record was reviewed and a re-interpretation, using the current catalog, revealed all requirements had been met for the major in Integrated Marketing Communication that is now listed among their offerings.
- At this point, she asked if her degree might be conferred with an effective date of 2005, but was informed this would not be possible because accepted practice does not allow a retroactive degree unless an employee made a clerical error.
- She filed a new degree application listing Integrated Marketing Communication as her major for December 2014. She will have that degree conferred on that date if she has satisfied all outstanding obligations.
- He is satisfied that her contention that she had no knowledge of her true situation fully comports with the facts as reconstructed on the basis of information in the University's files.

*Following this communication and concerns about representations made by the College regarding the degree in the visa application, the Chief Innovations Officer resigned effective September 19, 2014.*

**September 22, 2014** – The University's Provost sent a letter to TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit stating they were awarding an undergraduate degree in Integrated Marketing Communications as of the date of the letter.

**September 23, 2014** – The University's Provost sent a letter to the College President, thanking him for his call and stating that after additional review of the facts, a Bachelor of Arts Degree in Communication Studies was being awarded effective Spring 2005. The Provost cited the facts as 1) the Chief Innovations Officer had recorded sufficient credits by May 2005 to earn an undergraduate degree; 2) that faculty members had recently judged the courses she took to be compatible with the major in Communication Studies as it was then being offered; and 3) that her failure to appeal on those grounds at the time was due to the fact that she was never informed of questions raised about her academic record.

*Following this communication, the President asked the Chancellor about rescinding the Chief Innovations Officer's resignation letter. The Chancellor said that based on advice of the General Counsel's office, the issue of the visa appeared resolved and rescinding acceptance of the resignation would be appropriate. The Chancellor also said that other issues and allegations had been raised and he would need to wait on the results of the audit. The Chief Innovations Officer returned to her position the following day.*

In an interview with the College President after these communications with Duquesne University, where their determination on the degree changed several times, he was asked what he said to the Provost to change his mind about the timing of issuing the degree. The President said once Duquesne

stated they would date the degree as of the date of the letter, he asked if they can confer the degree as of today, why can't it be dated 2005.

Following these events, TBR Office of System-wide Internal Audit contacted the Provost's office by phone to attempt to understand the final determination in this situation and spoke with an assistant. The Provost responded later by email, stating he had nothing to add to the facts outlined in letters already sent to TBR and that the University took action, following an inquiry by the former student, to ensure that her academic record reflected the program of studies she completed on their campus.

The Duquesne Provost stated on September 19 that degree requirements had been met for the current degree offering, Integrated Marketing Communication, but the current catalog shows that the same course that was not successfully completed for the Communications Studies program, COMM 301W, *History of Communication*, is also required for the Integrated Marketing Communications program. No apparent changes occurred in the Communications Studies requirements or the Chief Innovations Officer's completed courses from the time she left the University in 2005, when a degree-audit by the University determined the requirements had not been met, until September 23, 2014, when the University issued a degree to her retroactively. They did not state that any errors were made in the 2005 determination or address whether the departmental core course requirement was waived or substituted in their recent reconsideration. But based on earlier communication with the Director of University Core Curriculum, it seems likely that they did waive the required course or substitute another non-departmental core course for the departmental core requirement.

The Chief Innovations Officer has stated that she did not know the degree had not been conferred and the Duquesne Provost's letter indicates there is no record of communication with her about their determination that the degree requirements had not been met after the May 2005 Commencement. It is not possible to know when she became aware she had not earned a degree. However, it is difficult to understand that after pursuing a degree for 4 years, taking a course required for that degree unsuccessfully on three occasions during those 4 years, and upon obtaining a copy of the unofficial transcript from Duquesne in 2011, which did not show the degree was earned or conferred, that one could not know the requirements had not been met.

#### *Success as an Entrepreneur and Other Position Requirements*

Information on work experience provided by the candidate differed between the application and résumé submitted for the Chief Innovations Officer position. On the résumé submitted for the position, the candidate listed Managing Director of *Green Monkey Construction* while the application listed Managing Director of *Green Monkey Construction Supplies*; both indicated she had held this position from June 2005 through the present, and the application reported it was full-time. However, neither indicated self-employment for this position. A company named *Green Monkey and Banana (GMB) Construction Supplies* was identified through the Corporate Affairs and Intellectual Property Office (CAIPO) of the Barbadian Ministry of Industry and the Chief Innovations Officer confirmed it was the company referred to in her application information. This clarification was necessary because other companies, which include the name Green Monkey, operate in Barbados. In an interview, the Chief Innovations Officer disclosed, that in this position, she was selling equipment for Stone Construction Equipment, Inc., of Honeye, New York. According to the employee and other research, Stone Construction Equipment closed because of foreclosure in early 2012; the Toro Company



announced that it was acquiring that company's assets in May 2012. While Green Monkey and Banana Construction Supplies was a Barbadian registered enterprise, there was no evidence found during this review of its existence on the internet, other than within company listings on search sites.

The application and résumé for the position also listed another recent position as Business Development Manager of *Island Girl Lifestyle*. It was listed on the application as a self-employed, full-time position. The application indicated this position started in October 2012 while the résumé indicated it started in August 2012. This company was registered with the Corporate Affairs and Intellectual Property Office (CAIPO) of the Barbadian Ministry of Industry on August 29, 2012. The only other evidence of this business found during the review was an internet site under construction. There was another *Island Girl Lifestyle* web site for a mail order company that had been in existence since 2012, but it was listed with different founders.

No documentation in support of entrepreneurial ownership of any company was submitted by the candidate with her application, nor was it requested for confirmation of her success as an entrepreneur by the College's Human Resources Office. The President said confirmation was not required because he had observed her businesses while in Barbados. He said his observations included her delivering products from her mail order business and a storage lot of equipment used in the construction supplies business. The Chief Innovations Officer said she began winding down operations of these businesses once she believed Chattanooga State would make an offer.

On her application, under computer skills, the candidate listed video blogs. She also asserted that she had excellent communication skills, another job requirement, in a cover letter submitted with the application.

#### *Job Description and Hiring Process Point to a Pre-Selected Candidate*

The advertised description for the position of Senior Executive Assistant to the President, later changed to Chief Innovations Officer, included requirements that give the impression it may have been created specifically for the candidate hired. The required qualifications in the description were a Bachelor's Degree in Business, Marketing and/or Communications, knowledge of the cultures and educational systems of Caribbean and British Commonwealth nations, demonstrated success as an entrepreneur, preferably in business, manifestly strong language and composition skills and experience with publishing blogs. These requirements substantially mirror the qualifications that the current Chief Innovations Officer asserted when she applied for the Senior Executive Assistant to the President in August 2013 and for the Associate Vice President of Leadership and Fund Development position in July 2013. Even though TBR guidelines and the institution's hiring guidelines require fair hiring practices, the creation of the job description, as well as other actions discussed in this report, suggest that a fair hiring process may not have been in place.

The College has the ability to write each job description to meet the needs of the College. TBR's General Personnel Policy, 5:01:00:00, Section II, Part E states, "The minimum qualifications for the appointment of all personnel other than faculty shall be determined by the President or director or designee, based upon the duties and responsibilities of the position..." The President stated he had tried to recruit this candidate for a year to come work for the College, after meeting her in Barbados in 2012. The Senior Executive Assistant to the President position was created in July 2013 from the vacated position of Manager of Public Relations in Student Services. It was posted on July 23, 2013,

less than two weeks after the candidate had been to Chattanooga to interview for the position of Associate Vice President of Leadership and Fund Development.

Staff participating on the search committee for the Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer said the President did not direct them to select this candidate but said it was apparent that he wanted her in the position. Even though one of the search committee members stated there were more-qualified candidates, each of them rated the current Chief Innovations Officer the highest of those interviewed.

TBR Guideline P-010, *Personnel Transactions and Recommended Forms*, directs institutions to follow Board policies to provide a fair hiring process. Section I, Part A, of this guideline states, in part:

Each President and director is expected to follow Board policies, affirmative action plans, and fair employment practices when making appointments.

1. Appointments requiring the Chancellor's approval will be reviewed in light of these expectations.
2. All appointments, regardless of salary, including promotions and transfers, must be reviewed and certified by the institutional Affirmative Action Officer prior to action.

Additionally, Section D of this guideline sets minimum requirements for all campus and system office appointments, stating, "the following actions or procedures are mandatory at all institutions, to: a) Establish an Affirmative Action Plan which sets goals for all categories of employment, and b) Develop appropriate recruitment and selection procedures to ensure fairness in employment..."

The College's *Search Committee Guidelines* state:

This process seeks to identify the best qualified candidate for a vacant position and intends to establish consistent, effective, and efficient college-wide hiring practices that comply with the legal aspects of employment and support and ensures the college's affirmative action philosophy...

Many businesses and some universities and school systems now employ chief innovations officers. Qualifications of the individuals holding positions with the same title in ten public universities, university systems or school systems identified, show that those individuals hold a Master's Degree, Doctorate or Medical Degree and have held a high-level position in their field. In contrast, the position description for Chattanooga State does not aim for candidates with advanced degrees or extensive experience, requiring a Bachelor's degree and success as an entrepreneur, without specifying a number of years in that capacity or defining success. Additionally, the requirement for candidates to have knowledge of the culture and educational systems of the Caribbean and British Commonwealth nations seems specifically pointed at the candidate hired. However, the President stated he knows others in the Chattanooga community who would qualify under these requirements.

The College had 30 applicants for the Chief Innovations Officer position and scheduled five candidates to interview, but one dropped out before the interview took place. According to the

College’s records, the interviews of the remaining 4 candidates were conducted as noted in the following chart.

<b>Chief Innovations Officer Candidate Interviews</b>		
August 21, 2013	8:00 a.m. (via Skype)	Candidate 1 (selected as Chief Innovations Officer)
	8:25 a.m.	Candidate 2
August 23, 2013	10:30 a.m.	Candidate 3
	11:00 a.m.	Candidate 4

Of the three other candidates interviewed, two asserted Bachelor’s degrees and one a Master’s degree. One of the individuals with a Bachelor’s degree, did not have a degree in one of the three areas listed in the job description. None of the three remaining candidates claimed knowledge of the cultures and educational systems of the Caribbean and British Commonwealth nations but one listed experience in Spanish speaking countries. Two of the three checked yes in response to a question about having entrepreneurial experience and listed a blog they publish.

The Interview Rating Forms were completed by the search team members on August 23. A recommendation for hire was made on August 27 and the President made an offer to the candidate the same day, with a salary of \$90,000 per year. As explained further in Item 2 in this report, the Labor Condition Application, required to begin the work visa process, was initiated by the Human Resources Director on August 21, the same day as the candidate’s interview by Skype, but prior to the completion of interviews of all candidates and prior to an offer of a position by the College.

In addition to the salary provided, the Chief Innovations Officer was paid \$4,338 for moving expenses and authorized for a \$100 cell phone allowance each month. The applicant worked for the College in a temporary position from November 20, 2013 through November 30, 2013 and became a permanent employee on December 2, 2013. The College did obtain references from three individuals before she was hired.

*Failure to Obtain Chancellor’s Approval for Hiring*

A change in TBR guidance requiring the Chancellor’s approval for the appointment of all employees reporting directly to the President, rather than only vice presidents, occurred a week before an offer was made to the Chief Innovations Officer, but was not adhered to by the College. TBR Guideline P-010, *Personnel Transactions and Recommended Forms*, Section I.B.2 requires institutions to submit for the Chancellor’s approval “all Vice Presidents or other executives reporting directly to the President, including all interim appointments.” The TBR Human Resources officers approved the change to add the wording “or other executives reporting directly to the President” during their quarterly meeting on June 26, 2013; the minutes from this meeting show that the Chattanooga State Human Resources Director attended. The revised Guideline became official on August 20, 2013, when the President’s Council, the minutes of which show the Chattanooga State President attended, approved the change.

Although the highest level of approval for changes to TBR guidelines is the approval of the President’s Council, changes to policies require Board approval. TBR Policy 5:01:00:00, *General Personnel Policy*,

includes the same wording noted in Guideline P-010 regarding the Chancellor's approval. The President's Council also approved the change to the policy at the August 20, 2013 meeting when the Guideline was changed, but the policy did not receive final approval until the Board voted on it at their meeting on September 20, 2013.

TBR Guideline P-010 was changed on August 20, 2013, a week before the Chief Innovations Officer was recommended for hire on August 27, 2013. It seems the President and Human Resources Director should have known of the change in the requirement because both attended meetings where this Guideline was approved. The College should have submitted the hiring recommendation to the Chancellor for approval, but did not. The College's Human Resources Director stated he thought the Guideline was changed after the Chief Innovations Officer was hired and that the Chancellor's approval was not thought to be required at that time.

#### Override of Acceptable Hiring Practices

Prior to the search for the Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer, in the summer of 2013, a search was conducted and completed for the Associate Vice President of Leadership and Fund Development. This position was posted on April 2, 2013 and the minimum educational requirement was an "MBA or Master's Degree in a field related to fund raising, leadership, etc." For work experience, the position called for "preferably at least three years of full-time experience in fund development with capital campaign experience; or substantial parallel experience in sales and promotion." The President said he let the individual later hired for the Senior Executive Assistant to the President know when this position was posted.

Of the eight applicants initially interviewed for this position, three did not meet the minimum educational requirements. The current Chief Innovations Officer was one of those interviewed without the minimum educational requirement. Of the four applicants chosen for a second interview, two did not have the minimum educational requirement; the current Chief Innovations Officer and the person selected for the position.

The college's *Search Committee Guidelines* provide search committees with guidance on how to conduct a job search. It states "applications of non-qualified applicants may be reviewed by the search committee but cannot be included in the interview process without written documentation from the President or appropriate Vice President indicating that the qualifications are acceptable." The Human Resources Director stated there was no such written authorization by the President, but that as the chair of the search committee, the President's approval was implicit in the process. The TBR Assistant Vice Chancellor for Human Resources stated that allowing a President to override the job requirements is not a normal business practice. She said that the Equity Officer could override the qualifications if there was a compelling need and that such an override would need to be documented. When asked whether he had the ability to perform such overrides, the campus Equity Officer stated he did not, that only the President had such authority.

The President stated that the issue of educational level was discussed by the search committee, which included Foundation Board representatives. He said that the Master's degree was not a disqualifying question in the online application system and therefore, all candidates were reviewed by the committee. The President said he could make exceptions to TBR Policy 5:01:00:00, *General Personnel Policy*, and did so because committee members requested an exception because of the

well-known success of the frontrunner, who had a Bachelor's degree but not a Master's degree. While the TBR *General Personnel Policy* does allow presidents the ability to create job specifications to fit the needs of the college, it does not provide for presidents to make exceptions to the position requirements once a search is in progress. It is the responsibility of the Human Resources Office to advise search committees on the appropriate procedures when such questions arise.

As previously referenced, TBR Guideline P-090, *Personnel Transactions and Recommended Forms*, directs institutions to follow Board policies to provide a fair hiring process. To ensure the integrity of the hiring process, searches where the minimum job requirements need amending after a position has been posted should result in the closing of the search and reposting of the position with revised minimum job requirements to allow for a fair and open search. By not reposting the position with the revised minimum educational requirement, others who may have had the revised credentials and would have applied for the position were denied the opportunity.

The individual now working as the current Chief Innovations Officer interviewed for the Associate Vice President position by Skype on June 10, 2013 and in-person in Chattanooga on July 12, 2013. Travel and lodging expenses paid for the candidate for this trip from July 11, 2013 through July 13, 2013 were \$1,432 (airfare, \$1,125 and lodging, \$307); the majority of these expenses were paid by the College, but \$86 for part of the lodging was paid by the college's affiliated Foundation. Other expenses totaling \$312 were incurred related to this trip and reimbursed to the President; these expenses included dinner for the candidate with the President and his wife on one occasion and four additional meals for the candidate and the President during her stay. Since this applicant did not meet the minimum requirements for the job, there is no reason an interview should have occurred and no business purpose for the travel and related costs. The Associate Vice President position was offered to and accepted by another candidate.

It should be noted that the College incurred costs related to bringing one other applicant to Chattanooga for a second interview during July 10, 2013 and July 11, 2013. Travel and lodging expenses for this candidate were \$638 (airfare, \$528 and lodging, \$110.) Other expenses totaling \$57 were incurred related to this trip and reimbursed to the President, which consisted of dinner for the candidate with the President and his wife. This applicant met the minimum requirements for the position and costs are not questioned.

## **2. Misrepresentation on Visa Application by College**

### Allegation

*The Chief Innovations Officer is not a U.S. citizen and without a degree, she would have had to lie to get a work visa.*

### Analysis

This allegation was substantiated in part; based on relying on faulty information provided by the candidate in her job application about a Bachelor's degree without validating the asserted academic credential, the President certified the same faulty information on the H-1B visa application to the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) of the U.S. Department of Homeland Security. The applicant is not a U.S. citizen, but is a citizen of Barbados. The College may sponsor individuals hired

from foreign countries in the work visa process. However, the failure to verify the applicant's degree and other missteps in submitting information for the Labor Condition Application and visa petition, placed the College at risk of penalties or greater repercussions.

The U.S. Department of Labor must certify the Labor Condition Application (LCA) after a job offer has been made and prior to the start of the visa application process. The College submitted the LCA before making a job offer, even though an offer is required to make application. In the LCA, the Human Resources Director agreed to certain condition statements; however, one condition, that notice had been provided to other workers that a nonimmigrant was being hired, had not been completed by the time of submission as required by federal regulations. Also, since filling the position, the position title and job responsibilities have changed significantly from those represented in a letter to the USCIS Premium Processing Officer and may require the filing of amended information.

#### *Mishandling of LCA and Visa Application Process*

Federal regulations establish the process for applying for a work visa. An H-1B is an employment-based, nonimmigrant visa category for temporary workers in specialty occupations. To obtain an H-1B visa, a non-citizen must have an employer who has offered a job and applies for the visa petition on behalf of the individual. The following steps are necessary in the petition for a visa for a prospective nonimmigrant employee and may take months to complete.

- Provide Public Notice – The employer must provide public notice to current workers, U.S. citizens, of the intent to hire a nonimmigrant for a position by posting the completed Labor Condition Application (LCA) for 10 days, within the 30-day period preceding the filing of the LCA.
- Request LCA Certification – The employer submits the online LCA, Form 9035E to the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL), Employment and Training Administration (ETA). The LCA requires information about the employer, position, planned salary, working conditions, prevailing wage and requires the employer attest to certain conditions. If the position is certified by the USDOL, the employer is notified by email.
- Petition for Visa – With the certified LCA, the employer's next step is to file a Petition for a Nonimmigrant Worker, Form I-129, with the USCIS, and include the required fees. If the petition is approved, the USCIS provides a Notice of Action, Form I-797, which is notice that the petition has been approved. It is provided by the employer to the prospective employee; it is not the work visa, but allows the nonimmigrant to obtain a visa stamp to work in the United States.
- Obtain Official Visa – With the approved Form I-797, the prospective employee schedules an interview with the designated Consulate or Embassy responsible for issuing the official visa.

The College's Human Resources Director submitted the LCA, required for the visa petition, for the Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer on August 21, 2013, less than three hours after the candidate's interview by Skype. This occurred several days before two other candidates were interviewed on August 23, 2013, before the search committee submitted Interview Rating Forms for each candidate on August 23, 2013 and before a recommendation for hire was posted on August 27, 2013 in the PeopleAdmin system, used by the College for tracking positions

and position postings. Most significantly, the process started without verification of the applicant's academic credentials, before a job offer was made to the candidate by the President and before public notice of the intent to hire a nonimmigrant for the position was given to other workers.

The Human Resources Director stated the LCA process would not normally be started until a candidate had been flagged as recommended for hire in the PeopleAdmin system. The Human Resources Director would not say if the President directed him to begin the visa application process. However, the Human Resources Director did agree that besides the system notification, he would have only started the visa process if directed by the Search Committee Chair or his direct supervisor, and in this situation, both were the President. The President said he did not tell the Director to start the process early, but that an earlier visa petition had taken a significant amount of time and the Director was "determined to avoid unnecessary delay." He also said that the two remaining applicants did not meet the expectations of the committee but were interviewed to give them "the benefit of the doubt" and because they "may have qualities sought for other potentially forthcoming positions..."

Federal regulations over the submission of an LCA to the USDOL to begin the visa process, require public notice must be given to workers that a nonimmigrant is being hired and require the individual completing the application to attest that notice has been provided. The Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 20 655.734 states, "such notification shall be given on or within 30 days before the date the labor condition application is filed..." The notice is required to be posted for at least 10 days. The Human Resources Director filed the initial LCA on August 21, 2013. The LCA was certified on September 18, 2013 and he said he posted the public notification of the LCA from September 19 through October 2, 2013. The posting of the public notice after the LCA was certified is not in compliance with federal regulations.

An H-1B visa is issued for a specialty occupation which requires theoretical and practical application of a body of specialized knowledge and requires at least a Bachelor's degree or its equivalent. The Code of Federal Regulations, Definitions, 655.715, defines Specialty Occupation for the H-1B program as "an occupation that requires theoretical and practical application of a body of specialized knowledge and attainment of a bachelor's degree (or its equivalent) in the specific specialty as a minimum for entry into occupation in the United States." Form I-129, petitioning for the H1-B visa, was filed by the College U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) of the Department of Homeland Security on September 29, 2013 and eventually approved on October 16, 2013. Upon submission of the petition form, the College provided several attachments, including the employment application, résumé and transcript, all of which represented the applicant's assertion of having a Bachelor's degree. The Form contained a statement signed by the President, which stated "I certify, under penalty of perjury that this petition and the evidence submitted with it are true and correct to the best of my knowledge." However, the College did not have information on file supporting this statement since the unofficial transcript from the applicant did not indicate a degree was conferred and they had not required the candidate to provide an official transcript. Without the degree, the candidate was ineligible for the H-1B visa.

As a result of a request for justification of this position as a specialty occupation during the visa process, the President wrote a letter on October 7, 2013 to the Premium Processing Officer of the

USCIS of the Department of Homeland Security, explaining the job requirements. In the justification letter, he stated, “at least 75% of this person’s time will be devoted to coordination with the University of the West Indies, as well as with Barbadian business and industry and developing effective programs to be offered in the Caribbean. The balance of this person’s time will be spent on the remaining job duties listed, all of which are rooted in knowledge of the Eastern Caribbean.” However, as noted in Item 5 below, the President reorganized some departments six months later, in April 2014, officially changing the position title of the Senior Executive Assistant to the President to Chief Innovations Officer and assigning her additional responsibilities as well as a \$1,500 per month stipend for the extra duties. The additional responsibilities described in the revised job description for the position and for the Community Education and Small Business Development Center sections, as represented in the revised organization chart, suggest the job duties of this position significantly changed since providing the description in the visa documents and explanation to the Department of Homeland Security.

The title of Chief Innovations Officer is not used in any of the documents submitted during the visa process, but is always referred to as the Senior Executive Assistant to the President. Management stated the title of Chief Innovations Officer was a working title, whereas the Senior Executive Assistant to the President was the title available and used in the College’s Banner – Human Resources system when the position was created.

The total costs to the College for the visa application and processing were \$2,050. The fees and amounts included in this total were \$325 for application fees; \$1,225 for premium processing; and \$500 for a fraud prevention fee.

### **3. Reorganization, New and Changed Positions, Misuse of Budgets, and Ignoring Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives**

#### **Allegations**

*Reorganization occurred and new positions were created so that the Chief Innovations Officer could move up. Funds have been misused from various budgets across campus, ignoring strategic plan goals and objectives. Funds have been misappropriated for travel, individual perks and unnecessary, nonexistent positions.*

#### **Analysis**

While reorganization did occur and positions were transferred between areas, the review did not substantiate that resources were misused or misappropriated for these purposes. Travel by the Chief Innovations Officer and the President is addressed in Item 5. Other than Item 7, regarding an allegation that the College provided a leased vehicle to the Chief Innovations Officer, travel, and a stipend added in July 2014, no other issues that might be referred to as “perks” were identified during the review. While these allegations did not include specific information, similar perceptions about concerns over budgets, positions and strategic plan goals and objectives were expressed by College personnel during interviews, particularly that the President was not focused on the success of students but on business ventures.



A reorganization plan affecting several departments was submitted by the College to TBR for approval in April 2014. Included in this reorganization was the official change of the title of the Senior Executive Assistant to the President to Chief Innovations Officer, along with the addition of other responsibilities. This change was followed by a monthly stipend of \$1,500 for the Chief Innovations Officer in July 2014. Between April and November 2014, several positions were moved from other areas to areas under the Chief Innovations Officer. Of eight positions analyzed, a total of three positions were moved to the Chief Innovations Officer's areas from student areas. This analysis included the position that is now the Chief Innovations Officer position, which had been moved in July 2013. Another position was moved from a student area to Corporate Training.

Movement of positions and related budget resources from one area to another frequently causes concern for those affected, but such changes do not necessarily indicate impropriety. The President has the ability to organize the College's operations to meet the needs and goals of the institution. However, resources should be allocated to ensure that strategic plan goals are achieved.

#### *Reorganization, New and Changed Positions, Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives*

The College advertised for the position of Senior Executive Assistant to the President on July 23, 2013. The President stated that this position was intended to be the Chief Innovations Officer, with the role of creating new revenue streams for the College to replace decreasing state support. The Chief Innovations Officer title was used from the time the position was filled in November 2013 even though the request for organizational changes that included this title change, was not submitted to the TBR system office until April 2014. The Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer position was formerly a Manager position in Student Affairs.

The President submitted a new organization chart for the College, for fiscal year 2014 – 2015, to TBR for approval in April 2014. The chart and an attachment included the following changes:

- The position title of Senior Executive Assistant to the President has been changed to Chief Innovations Officer based on clarification of the role.
- The position of VP of Economic and Community Development has been eliminated, resulting in the assignment of the Continuing Education Department and SBDC to the Chief Innovations Officer. The Director of Corporate Training will report directly to the President who serves as lead in major corporate partnerships.
- The position of Associate VP for Institutional Effectiveness, Research and Marketing was reclassified to VP for Institutional Effectiveness, Research and Marketing based on the growing criticality of these areas for funding, accreditation and completion initiatives.
- The Eastgate Center off-campus was officially closed in February 2014, resulting in the elimination of the position, Director of the Eastgate Campus.
- The Title of Dean of School Relations was changed to Dean of Honors and Special Programs to reflect his actual responsibilities.
- The Business and Information Technologies Division was moved from Vice President of Academic Affairs to the Vice President of Technology to better align Business/IT curricula with Engineering Technologies and our TCAT.

In addition to the title change, the responsibilities for the Chief Innovations Officer were changed in April 2014 and, according to the President, the College began paying her an additional monthly stipend of \$1,500 in July 2014 because of the increased responsibilities of the position. The stipend is scheduled to continue through June 2015. As of November 1, 2014, a new organization chart was developed which shows three divisions under the Chief Innovations Officer as Innovations, Community Education, and the Small Business Development Center.

The perception of many staff interviewed was that resources were being diverted from academic and student related areas, where they were needed, to the areas under the Chief Innovations Officer, indicating the administration was ignoring strategic plan goals and objectives. Many staff interviewed also thought the positions were being moved to avoid Board approval of new positions. The Chief Innovations Officer position and seven positions under her in the Innovations and Community Education divisions were examined for their origin and changes. As noted above, the Chief Innovations Officer also has responsibility for SBDC but these positions are not shown in the chart because that unit was not part of this review.

The majority of changes noted in the following table were made between April 2014, when the Senior Executive Assistant position was officially changed to Chief Innovations Officer, and November 2014. However, in July 2013, the Senior Executive Assistant to the President/Chief Innovations Officer position was created and originated from a vacant Manager of Public Relations position in Student Affairs. Two of the other positions were vacant as a result of terminations of incumbents (previous titles of Vice President of Economic and Community Development and Administrative Assistant in Continuing Education), neither of which originated from student or academic areas. Two other positions were vacated when, according to the incumbents, they felt they were being pressured to retire, or were even warned they were about to be terminated (previous titles of Manager of Continuing Education and Specialist in the Learning Center); one of these positions was from a student area. A fifth position, from a student area, had an incumbent who was told the position was being terminated even though it had already been moved to the new division as an Administrative Assistant; this employee accepted a lower paying position in another department to keep a position and health insurance (previous title of Executive Secretary in Student Affairs). Upon her acceptance of a transfer, the position, rather than being terminated as was represented to the employee, was advertised and filled. Two other vacant positions were moved to Community Education (previous titles of Custodian in Maintenance and Media Representative in Marketing); neither position originated from a student or academic area.

One other position, not included in the following chart because it does not report to the Chief Innovations Officer, was formerly a Computer Program Analyst in Library Services, a student area. It was transferred to the Corporate Training division.

**Summary of Positions Moved to Chief Innovations Officer - Innovations and Community Education**

<b>Position #</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Division</b>	<b>Previous Title &amp; Status</b>	<b>Previous Division</b>
601030	Chief Innovations Officer	Innovations	Manager	Student Affairs
630010	Assistant to Chief Inn. Officer	Innovations	Executive Secretary	Student Affairs
603010	IT Project Manager	Innovations	Vice President	Community Dev.
542100*	Project Manager, CE Finance	Community Education	Manager	Continuing ED
740020	Marketing Specialist	Community Education	Custodian	Maintenance
176010*	Enrichment Coach	Community Education	Administrative Assistant	Continuing ED
570090*	External Liaison	Community Education	Specialist/Account Clerk	Learning Center
600040	Internal Liaison	Community Education	Media Representative	Marketing

\* No current Personnel Action Form on file.

Overall, three positions were moved to the Innovations area and appear to have originated from student areas and none from academic areas. One other position was moved from a student area (Library Services) to Corporate Training, which is under a different unit. In addition, three of the current positions reviewed did not have Personnel Action Forms (PAFs) to document new titles. The Payroll Coordinator entered the positions in Banner based on the signed contracts. Her request to Human Resources for current PAFs has not been acknowledged.

The President said the reorganization and re-staffing were essential to turn the Continuing Education operation around, since it was on track to lose \$225,000 this year. He said that the Chief Innovations Officer was given a one-year assignment to build an aggressive new team and strong revenue-generating unit. He said it had been successful with the launch of a retooled Community Education program by December 1, 2014. He also said that two of the positions would support a ramp up of corporate training in late 2015, when workforce development is expected to rebound. The President said there was a stated commitment to managers that each transferred position would be restored in the next budget, if justified and resourced. He said the net effect of the position transfers will be a substantial financial and student recruitment gain for the college. Because these are recent changes, the impact of these changes on Community Education are not known. From comments received, however, staff in areas where positions have been lost believe the changes have been detrimental to their operations and to the completion goals for the College.

**Misuse of Budgets**

An analysis of budget and actual amounts for the areas currently under the Chief Innovations Officer for the periods from FY12 to FY15 was performed. The actual amounts were generally the same between FY12 and FY13. However, the actual amounts jumped 27% from FY13 to FY14, and the revised FY15 budget was 26% greater than FY14 actual numbers. Management stated a large part of this increase was due to increases in personnel. Multiple positions added were reallocated from other departments, resulting in a higher budget.

This reallocation of resources comes at a time when the employees perceive the campus is being more fiscally conservative in other areas, but not in the areas under the Chief Innovations Officer.

Management stated that although they expect significant, campus-wide budgets cuts may be coming, they have been delayed so far by other means, such as limiting any educational assistance to employees to only the fee waivers for employees (formerly PC-191s), limiting full-time faculty to teaching only one summer class, and higher scrutiny of travel expenses.

#### **4. University of the West Indies and Other Innovations Initiatives**

##### Allegation

*The Chief Innovations Officer was hired to develop a relationship with the University of the West Indies, however, no such relationship has been developed.*

##### Analysis

This allegation was substantiated in part; even though a Memorandum of Understanding has been in place with the University of the West Indies since August 8, 2013, no programs have been established under the agreement. The President said the relationship with the University of the West Indies is only one relationship the Chief Innovations Officer was challenged to develop. He also said the relationship had been finalized, as evidenced by a Memorandum of Understanding. The five-year agreement between the College and the University of the West Indies was executed months before the Chief Innovations Officer was hired in November 2013 and is a cooperative agreement for institutional exchange programs with no financial obligations. At the time of the review, no exchange programs had yet been developed under this agreement.

The President mentioned other initiatives the Chief Innovations Officer had been working on, including one with Yeshiva University for entrepreneurship and the Honors College program; one with Gallup to act as the primary portal for entrepreneurial string finders; and a training program with the Barbados Manufacturing Association. Although the President stated he has been working on these projects for some time, as of the date of this report, these initiatives have not resulted in new programs for the College. Also, as referenced in Item 3, the Chief Innovations Officer's title and responsibilities were revised in April 2014. With the addition of other responsibilities, it is not clear how much time will be spent by the Chief Innovations Officer on special initiatives.

## Section II – Travel Expenses

---

### 5. Travel by the President and Chief Innovations Officer

#### Allegations

*The President and the Chief Innovations Officer are using state funds to travel to Barbados, Washington D. C. and other locations; this travel is more personal in nature than business, such as travel to Barbados.*

#### Analysis

This allegation was partially substantiated because there was no clear business purpose for a significant portion of the Chief Innovations Officer's first trip to Barbados; the President was in Barbados during most of this same period, but was on annual leave and claimed no business expenses. The review identified several trips taken by both the President and the Chief Innovations Officer. Although a business purpose was given for each trip, there was not a clear business need for the travel to Barbados from December 28, 2013 through January 13, 2014 because meetings did not appear to have been planned in advance and many individuals were not available because of the holidays; the first meeting held during that trip was on January 6, 2014. The Chief Innovations Officer incurred expenses totaling \$1,691.

On the second trip to Barbados from July 23 through August 3, 2014, the official itinerary did not list any meetings after July 31; after discussing these August travel dates with the President on two occasions, he provided an addendum to the itinerary, that he prepared in October 2014, showing additional meetings on those dates.

Other travel together to Anaheim, California, Washington, D.C., Boston, Massachusetts, and New York, New York, were trips to conferences or meetings with potential partners for the President's planned innovation initiatives. Costs of these trips have not been questioned, but better documentation is needed for unexplained changes in schedules and charges.

#### Summary of Travel

The President stated he hired a Chief Innovations Officer to develop optional revenue streams to support the College's programs because of diminishing state revenues. Many of the trips taken together from December 2013 through August 2014 were related to potential projects the President had identified for generating alternative revenue. In addition, two of the trips were for conferences. The summary on the following page includes all of the trips made together.

**Travel by the President and Chief Innovations Officer  
For the Period December 1, 2013 to August 31, 2014**

<b>Travel Dates</b>	<b>Stated Purpose</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Costs</b>
12/4/13 – 12/5/13	Holiday Party gathering at Vice Chancellor’s residence and TBR Quarterly Board Meeting	Nashville, TN	\$190
12/28/13 – 1/11/14 (President); 12/28/13 – 1/13/14 (Chief Innovations Officer)	Working with the University of the West Indies (Expenses for Chief Innovations Officer only.)	Barbados	\$1,691
3/1/14 – 3/5/14	League of Innovations, Presentation of SAILS by President	Anaheim, CA	\$2,781
4/1/14 – 4/8/14	HERDI 2014 Conference and AACC 2014 Conference	Washington, D.C.	\$4,509
4/15/14 – 4/17/14	Educate Online to discuss future strategies	Boston, MA	\$1,108
5/13/14 – 5/14/14	Yeshiva University Visit	New York, NY	\$4,234
6/16/14 – 6/20/14	Meeting with GALLOP, STEM Council Meeting and TBR Quarterly Meeting	Washington D.C & Nashville, TN	\$3,508
7/23/14 – 8/3/14	Meetings with the Barbados Manufacturing Association, U.S. Ambassador, University of the West Indies and Community Leaders	Barbados	\$5,242
Total Travel Costs			\$23,263

**Testwork on Compliance with Travel Policy and Reporting Requirements**

Testwork on the President’s travel expenses showed that they were in compliance with the Board’s travel policy except that explanations for certain costs were not sufficiently documented in the records, including reasons for changes in travel arrangements resulting in additional costs and use of a rental car with a GPS and the higher-priced option of pre-paid gas and two reimbursement requests were submitted more than 30 days after the travel occurred. Specific detail of these items are included with summaries of each trip below. The College submits quarterly reports to TBR of the President’s expenses and some reporting errors were made by the preparer in reporting the travel expenses because of apparent misunderstanding of the instructions. It was noted during the review of transactions that the President did pay for and receive reimbursement for some of the travel expenses of the Chief Innovations Officer, such as hotel and transportation expenses. The President said that he paid some of the travel expenses because the Chief Innovations Officer had issues with how her name was presented on her social security card and could not initially obtain a credit card.

Testwork on the Chief Innovations Officer’s travel expenses showed that they were in compliance with the Board’s travel policy except that there was no clear business purpose for a portion of the travel to Barbados from December 28, 2013 through January 13, 2014, and one travel reimbursement request was not submitted within 30 days. There was no itinerary available for the December 2013 to January 2014 Barbados trip, which could have helped document its business purpose. Regarding the lack of scheduled meetings and difficulty arranging them once in Barbados because of the holiday season, the Chief Innovations Officer stated that the President “wanted to capitalize on the fact that he was on the island during his vacation time, instead of having to go back in January.”

Barbados – February 16, 2013 to February 24, 2013

The President and the former Vice President of Economic and Community Development traveled to Barbados on Saturday, February 16, 2013 with a return date of Sunday, February 26, 2013, to formalize an agreement with the University of the West Indies and meet with the U.S. Ambassador to discuss recruiting students for Chattanooga State.

Although there was no itinerary included with the Vice President of Economic and Community Development's travel claim, there was an itinerary included with the President's travel claim, which showed at least one business meeting for each day of the trip.

The costs paid by the College for the Vice President of Economic and Community Development on this trip were \$5,095 (airfare, \$1,021; lodging, \$3,419; meals and incidentals, \$520; baggage fees, \$50; taxi fares, \$25; and parking fees, \$60). The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$5,603 (airfare, \$1,021; lodging, \$3,419; meals and incidentals, \$676; car rental, \$454; internet access, \$20; and phone, \$13). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$10,698.

Barbados – December 28, 2013 to January 13, 2014

The President and the Chief Innovations Officer traveled to Barbados on Saturday, December 28, 2013 with a planned return date of January 7, 2014 for the CIO and January 11, 2014 for the President, to continue to develop relationships with the University of the West Indies and other business representatives. The flight for the Chief Innovations Officer was changed to Monday, January 13, to remain in Barbados for meetings scheduled after arriving in Barbados. Although a trip itinerary was not available, the President and the Chief Innovations Officer did provide an agenda for a meeting with several business associations' representatives for January 6, 2014. By email at a later time, the Chief Innovations Officer recalled there was an additional meeting on January 7, 2014 that included some government officials and other business and University representatives. Additionally, in an email from the President to the Chief Innovations Officer on January 7, 2014, he directed her to look into changing the time of her return flight and refers to the meeting for that day and wrap-up meetings on Friday and Saturday (presumed to be January 10 and 11) with the U.S. Ambassador and his staff. Near the end of the review, the President provided another email string with a Barbadian official indicating what appeared to be an informal meeting on December 30.

December 30 and 31 were administrative closing days for the College and January 1 was a holiday. The President used leave for scheduled work days during this trip and was not reimbursed any expenses by the College. The President said that he has a time share in Barbados that he used during this trip and has traveled there for many years. He said that even though he was on vacation, he and the Chief Innovations Officer worked the entire time they were in Barbados. The Chief Innovations Officer also said she had worked the week the College was closed. However, as previously stated, it appears much of the planning and scheduling of meetings could have been performed from the College, without incurring travel costs. Information provided by the Chief Innovations Officer and statements made about the trip indicate much of the time on this trip was spent working on grant and other project proposals, which could have been performed at the College.

The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$1,691 (airfare, \$1,427; cost to change flight, \$225; and shuttle service, \$39). The Chief Innovations Officer did not

claim any lodging because she stayed with family and she was not paid for meal expenses, resulting in relatively low costs for this trip. She did submit a request for reimbursement of some meals and incidental expenses, but the claim was returned to her with a request for an itinerary for the trip; the claim was not resubmitted. In error, expenses for this trip were not disclosed by the preparer on the unaudited travel schedule for the President even though other travel expenses for the Chief Innovations Officer were reported; the Chief Innovations Officer's expenses were usually included because they were considered to be incurred at the direction of the President.

Barbados – July 23 to August 3, 2014

The President and the Chief Innovations Officer traveled to Barbados together again on Wednesday, July 23, 2014 and returned Sunday, August 3, 2014. The purpose of the trip was for the President to speak to the Rotary Club of Bridgetown on July 24, for the Chief Innovations Officer to make a presentation to the Barbados Manufacturing Association (BMA) at their Anniversary Dinner on July 26 and to continue to work on establishing relationships with other business representatives. Other meetings were included on the official itinerary provided by the U.S. Ambassador's office for Friday, July 25 and Monday through Thursday, July 28 through 31. The official itinerary did not include any business activities for Saturday, July 27, Friday August 1 or Saturday, August 2. The lack of business activities for these days was discussed with the President at various times. However, after interviews on October 16, 2014 with the President and Chief Innovations Officer, the President's Administrative Assistant sent an itinerary by email for August 1 through 3, listing meetings or calls each day. The properties for the file states it was created by the President on October 17, 2014.

The BMA covered the costs for the Chief Innovations Officer's round-trip airfare and two nights lodging in Barbados; no other lodging expenses were submitted to the College for reimbursement because she stayed with family. The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$711 (meals and incidentals, \$661; and baggage fees, \$50). The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$4,531 (airfare, \$1,223; lodging, \$1,931; meals and incidentals, \$679; car rental, \$649; and baggage fees, \$50). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$5,242.

Anaheim, California – March 1 to March 5, 2014

The business purpose for the trip to Anaheim, California from March 1 to March 5, 2014 was to attend the League of Innovations where Chattanooga State staff and the President made presentations of the Seamless Alignment and Integrated Learning Support (SAILS) program and other topics. Also while in California, the President stated he and the Chief Innovations Officer visited four colleges and took self-guided tours of these colleges to see how the buildings were designed. The President stated that colleges in California had to request capital funding through an appeal to taxpayers, for approval of a "millage tax." Since each college had to obtain funding directly from the taxpayers, the President stated he was extremely interested in seeing how the buildings were designed to maximize space and the funding dollars. The President stated he and the Chief Innovations Officer simply drove or walked around each campus. Travel to the four colleges to observe the architecture was not documented on the claim or any of the attachments included with the travel claim.

The cost of a rental car of \$353, a GPS device at \$11.99 per day and a "fuel service option" of \$68.69 was included on the President's travel claim for the trip to Anaheim. According to TBR's General



Travel Policy, charges for automobile rentals are allowed “whenever it is more economical than alternative methods of transportation or it is the only practical means of transportation.” The Travel Policy also states “whenever possible, employees should refuel before returning vehicles.” However, the travel claim did not include any explanation or support justifying the rental car or related expenses. When documentation was requested to show the rental car was more economical than alternatives, management responded that 15 plus people from Chattanooga State attended the conference and renting a car was more economical simply because of the number of attendees that needed to get back and forth from the hotel and airport. Management stated the GPS was necessary because of the numerous colleges visited while on the trip and the fuel service option was chosen because there was no time to stop and fill up the car due to a late presentation on the last day of the conference.

The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$714 (airfare, \$394; lodging provided at no cost by conference; meals and incidentals, \$320). The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$2,067 (airfare, \$394; lodging, \$839; meals and incidentals, \$320; car rental, \$353; baggage fees, \$50; and parking fees, \$112). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$2,781.

Washington, D.C. – April 1 to 8, 2014

The business purpose for the April 2014 trip to Washington D.C. was to attend the Higher Education Research and Development Institute (HERDI) Spring 2014 Session held from April 1, 2014 to April 4, 2014 and the 94<sup>th</sup> Annual American Association of Community Colleges (AACC) Convention held April 6, 2014 to April 8, 2014.

The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$2,148 (airfare, \$245; lodging, \$1,122; meals and incidentals \$266; registration fee, \$450; cab fare, \$15, and baggage fees, \$50). The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$2,362 (airfare, \$225; lodging, \$842; meals and incidentals, \$461; registration, \$815; and other expenses, \$19). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$4,509.

Boston, Massachusetts – April 15 to 17, 2014

The business purpose for the trip to Boston, Massachusetts was to meet with Educate Online to discuss potential future partnerships between Educate Online and Chattanooga State.

The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$581 (airfare was paid by Educate Online; lodging, \$262; meals and incidentals \$179; cab fares, \$90; and baggage fees, \$50). The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$528 (airfare was paid by Educate Online; lodging, \$262; meals and incidentals, \$179; baggage fees, \$25; and cab fares, \$61). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$1,108.

New York – May 13 to 14, 2014

The business purpose for travel to New York, New York from May 13 to 14, 2014 was to meet with various leaders at Yeshiva University to discuss potential, future partnerships. While on a business trip to New York, the President and the Chief Innovations Officer were in a wreck en route to the airport for their returning flight. This incident caused them to miss their departing flight. Upon arriving at the airport, the President purchased two flights at the gate so they could return home.

The President's travel claim included the cost of the additional return flights purchased at the gate and the appropriate documentation was attached to the travel claim. However, there was no explanation documented of why the college paid for two additional tickets for the returning flights.

The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$1,451 (airfare, \$958; lodging, \$304; meals and incidentals, \$153; and ferry, \$37). The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$2,783 (airfare, \$1,887; lodging, \$304; meals and incidentals, \$153; internet access, \$10; and taxi/ferry costs, \$430). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$4,234.

Washington, D.C./Nashville TN – June 16, to 20, 2014

The business purpose for the trip to Washington D.C. between June 16, 2014 and June 18, 2013, was to meet with representatives of the Gallop Corporation on June 17, 2014 regarding possible partnerships, as well as to attend a STEM Council meeting, a project of STEMConnector on June 18, 2014. This STEM Council meeting convened stakeholders from industry, government, education and the non-profit sector to share best practices in STEM education and workforce development. The business purpose for the trip to Nashville, Tennessee from June 18, 2013 to June 20, 2013, was to attend a Tennessee Board of Regents quarterly meeting.

The costs paid by the College for the Chief Innovations Officer on this trip were \$1,658 (airfare, \$585; lodging, \$873; and meals and incidentals, \$200.) The costs paid by the College for the President on this trip were \$1,850 (airfare, \$449; lodging, \$873; meals and incidentals, \$200; cab fares, \$227; and parking, \$101). The total cost to the College for this trip was \$3,508.

## Section III – Other Matters

---

### 6. Claim of Nepotism

#### Allegation

*Nepotism is occurring at the highest level of the administration.*

#### Analysis

This allegation was not substantiated based on applying the Board's policy; the allegation did not include information identifying the employees involved, but inquiries were made and documents reviewed regarding potential nepotism issues that may have involved the President. However, for one of the potential issues reviewed, it would have been better to have avoided hiring a person related to another employee in the same department. While the President approved this hiring, the TBR nepotism policy does not give presidents the authority to override the requirements of the policy.

#### Review of Potential Nepotism Issues

The College's Vice President for Business and Finance stated there are numerous employees on campus with a relative who also works on campus. TBR Policy 5-01-00-06, *Nepotism*, does not prohibit relatives from working for an institution, but does prohibit employees of an institution that are relatives being placed within a direct line of supervision, where one relative is supervising the job performance or work activities of another.

The first potential issue reviewed was the College's employment of a relative of the President. This individual worked in the library and reported to a Secretary in Library Services during the academic terms of Summer and Fall 2011 and Summer and Fall 2012. Since the President had no direct supervision of his relative, this employment did not meet the definition of nepotism.

The second potential issue reviewed was the College's employment of a relative of the then Managing Director of Corporate Training, a division of Workforce Development and Continuing Education. The Managing Director's relative was hired in the same department in a temporary position during June 2011 and June, July and August 2014. The Vice President for Business and Finance stated the President approved the work arrangement and it was observed that the payroll forms for the summer 2014 period included the President's initials.

The Manager of Business and Industry Training works in this department and supervises all temporary workers, but said that the Managing Director, the relative of the temporary employee, signed all payroll documents for the department. He further stated that the President's signature for the payroll records was obtained in this situation because of the relationship. Although some policies allow for the President to approve an exemption to policy, the Nepotism policy does not include such an exemption. In this situation, with the relative/temporary worker reporting to a Manager, who reports to the Director with overall authority for the department, it would have been better to have avoided hiring the relative in the same department.

## **7. Chief Innovations Officer Car Lease**

### **Allegation**

*The Chief Innovations Officer has a car lease paid by the College.*

### **Analysis**

This allegation was not substantiated. The Vice President for Business and Finance verified that the College had not paid for a leased vehicle for the Chief Innovations Officer.

## **8. Other Issues Identified During the Review**

### **Leave Not Taken**

The College's records did not show that the Chief Innovations Officer requested and took annual leave when she traveled to Duquesne on August 29, 2014. When interviewed on October 16, 2014, the Chief Innovations Officer stated she did not use leave for the trip, seemed unaware of how the leave process worked and was not sure if she had ever used leave, although then said she thought she did use leave once. On October 27, 2014, she emailed the auditor a copy of a leave slip for August 29 that was also dated August 29, but apparently prepared after the inquiry. The leave was entered during the October cycle because the College does not retroactively add leave into the system, but records it when submitted.

## Section IV – Interviews to Determine Campus Climate

---

The Chancellor and the Chair of the Board’s Audit Committee requested that the audit include interviews of College staff to gauge the “campus climate.” Interviews were conducted of numerous employees, including upper management, professional staff, and former employees.

Various employees mentioned that the current President had been forward thinking in many areas and spoke of the growth the campus has experienced. However, most also stated they felt morale on campus was low. When asked why the morale was low, many of them had similar responses.

With the decline of state appropriations over the past few years, the campus has had to make some difficult financial decisions. The decline of state funding has caused public institutions of higher education to seek out alternative funding sources. Although the current administration has ideas for alternative revenue streams, the perception on campus is that these ideas do not result in significant revenue realization. Certainly, the College’s partnerships with Volkswagen and Wacker are perceived as highly successful, garnering national attention. But some projects are not perceived as successful or realistic and some have included significant outlays of resources. Such projects include, but are not be limited to:

- In Cab University (Fiscal Year 2007) – An initiative to educate truck drivers via online education that was said to not have not been supported by the trucking companies.
- Build Your Own Business (BYOB) (Fiscal Year 2007-Fiscal Year 2009) – An initiative to offer videos to entrepreneurs on issues pertinent to starting a successful business, but was not viable after putting significant resources into it and then it ended.
- Partnership with the University of the West Indies (Ongoing) – An initiative to start a student/faculty exchange program, but for which no results have been achieved.
- Partnership with Gallup (Developing) – An initiative to offer entrepreneurial boot camps during the off-season to recent graduates who score high in entrepreneurial areas of a Gallup assessment.
- Partnership with Yeshiva (Developing) – An initiative to offer online classes to Yeshiva students.

Employees understand the value of seeking and obtaining alternative revenue streams in the current funding environment for public higher education; however, they do not see the current administration as adequately vetting projects to ensure state resources are used wisely. Indeed, some current and former employees perceive that even upper management of the College is unable to voice dissenting views of these proposals to the President for fear of retribution.

Staff also question the qualifications of employees leading these efforts and the amount of resources being spent to develop alternative revenue streams. As one interviewee stated, if the management over these areas had “hit some home runs before” maybe the morale would be positive. In addition to the hiring of the Chief Innovations Officer, employees see positions from departments across the campus being moved to her areas; multiple positions have been moved under the Chief Innovations

Officer since April 2014. Some staff question allocating college resources to developing alternative revenue streams when they believe it would be better to devote those resources to increasing enrollment and increasing student success. Several believe upper management is more focused on entrepreneurial activities than on the students.

Recent news articles have certainly affected morale. Several mentioned the President's comments about degrees not being very important as an example that his focus is not on students, which decreases morale. Faculty credentials are held to a high standard, and faculty expect high standards to also apply to professional staff, particularly when required by a job description.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. The Tennessee Board of Regents and the Chancellor should work with College administration to promote the efficient operation and management of the institution and to address the specific issues noted in this report. In beginning to address these matters, College administration should work toward creating an environment of transparency in its operations.
2. College administration should ensure the adherence to a strategic planning process that incorporates the mission and goals of the College and results in the allocation of budgetary and position resources toward the achievement of those goals. This process should provide for periodic checks on the accomplishment of goals based on established criteria and should be flexible to allow for changes when the rationale for doing so remains within the established mission and goals. The consideration of new initiatives and projects should be considered in light of the mission and goals of the College and the allocation of resources to these activities should be based on documented and reliable data, feasibility studies, business plans or other similar sources.
3. Within the Human Resources and Affirmative Action offices, College administration and management should implement procedures to ensure that all personnel actions are handled strictly in accordance with Board policies and guidelines and institutional policies and procedures that ensure a fair hiring process, including but not limited to the following:
  - a. Develop minimum position requirements based on the scope of the job.
  - b. Select candidates for consideration based on established minimum requirements.
  - c. Conduct position searches in accordance with established policies and guidelines, ensuring a fair and open process to identify the most qualified candidates.
  - d. Close and restart searches when re-analysis of position requirements indicate changes are necessary.
  - e. Require official transcripts for all positions requiring degrees and validate all other required credentials before hiring a candidate. Perform background checks based on institutional policy.
  - f. Consult with legal counsel on all future visa applications to ensure the College has appropriate advice on these transactions and the process is completed properly. Consult with legal counsel on any past applications where issues may need resolution.

- g. Request the approval of the Chancellor for all personnel actions requiring this higher level of approval, in accordance with Board policy.
- 4. Evaluate and document the business need for all travel through the travel authorization process, before it occurs.
- 5. Instruct all employees to document any changes in planned schedules or changes resulting in additional costs during travel and ensure review and approval for propriety before reimbursement occurs.
- 6. Evaluate orientation instructions provided to employees for accruing, using and recording leave benefits and ensure internal controls are in place to properly account for leave.
- 7. Remind employees of conflict of interest policies, including reporting responsibilities, on a routine basis and avoid employment and other business activities where the perception of a conflict of interest, such as nepotism, may exist.

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Summary of the President's Expenses**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

	Supplemental Schedule	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total
		Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation		
<b>President:</b>							
Salary and Benefits		\$ 230,484	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 230,484
Travel	A	15,967	236	7,172	-	-	23,376
Business Meals and Hospitality	B	9,054	357	638	1,262	-	11,311
Other Expenses	C	4,269	2,033	17,646	-	-	23,948
Discretionary Allowance		4,000	-	-	-	-	4,000
Housing Allowance		10,800	-	-	-	-	10,800
Other Allowances		1,800	-	-	-	-	1,800
		<u>276,374</u>	<u>2,626</u>	<u>25,456</u>	<u>1,262</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>305,718</u>
<b>President's Office:</b>							
Salary and Benefits (2.5 FTE)		136,838	-	4,521	-	-	141,359
Travel		9	86	1,984	-	-	2,079
Business Meals and Hospitality		-	-	-	-	-	-
Other Expenses		4,076	-	5,000	-	-	9,076
		<u>140,924</u>	<u>86</u>	<u>11,505</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>152,515</u>
<b>Total Expenses</b>		<u><b>\$ 417,297</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 2,712</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 36,961</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 1,262</b></u>	<u><b>\$ -</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 458,232</b></u>

**Additional Disclosures:**

Vehicle - The President is provided the use of a vehicle. The purchase cost of the vehicle in Fiscal Year 2014 was \$13,500 (which is net a 16,500.00 Trade-in and \$3,000 rebate).

*Report Objective: In accordance with TCA 49-14-104, this is a report of expenses made by, at the direction of, or for the benefit of the president for the period and includes expenses from the president's institutional operating budget, as well as any discretionary expenses from unrestricted gifts, foundation funds, athletic funds, sponsorship fees, licenses and royalty funds, and other such funds that would not be included in the operating budget for the president's office for the period indicated. The report includes two sections, one for the expenses made by, at the direction of, or for the benefit of the president and the other for the remaining expenses of the president's office.*



**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule A - Travel Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Departure Date	Return Date	Date Paid	Location	Purpose	Transportation	Lodging	Meals & Incidentals	Other	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Organization & Account Code
									Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation			
7/23/13	7/24/13	7/30/13	Dickson, TN	President's Annual Retreat	-	90	-	-	-	90	-	-	-	90	100001-73100
9/18/13	9/20/13	3/27/14	Nashville, TN and Clarksville, TN	2013 Maxine Smith Fellows Dinner and TBR Qtrly at Austin Peay	-	219	11	-	-	230	-	-	-	230	100001-73100
9/27/13	10/2/13	7/23/13	Seattle, WA	HERDI	225	-	-	-	A	225	-	-	-	225	100001-73200
11/4/13	11/5/13	11/26/13	Nashville, TN	Community College President's Meeting	-	143	-	-	-	143	-	-	-	143	100001-73100
12/4/13	12/5/13	12/19/13	Nashville, TN	Holiday Party gathering at Vice Chancellor's residence and TBR Quarterly Meeting	-	95	-	-	-	95	-	-	-	95	100001-73300 101001-73300
1/26/14	1/28/14	3/11/14	Orlando, FL	2014 Futures Assembly, Bellweather Presentation for SAILS	287	473	98	57	-	915	-	-	-	915	100001-73200 101001-73200
3/1/14	3/5/14	3/18/14	Anaheim, CA	League for Innovation 2014, Presentation of SAILS	394	839	320	515	-	2,067	-	-	-	2,067	100001-73400 101001-73400
3/26/14	3/28/14	4/3/14	Nashville, TN	TN Complete College Summit; TBR Community College President Mtg; TBR Qtrly Board Meeting	-	286	149	-	-	435	-	-	-	435	100001-73100
4/1/14	4/8/14	2/27/14	Washington, DC	HERDI 2014 Conf & AACC 2014 Conference	225	842	461	834	-	2,361	-	-	-	2,361	100001-73200 101001-73200
4/15/14	4/17/14	4/24/14	Boston, MA	Ed Online discuss future strategies	-	262	179	88	-	528	-	-	-	528	100001-73400 101001-73400
5/13/14	5/14/14	5/6/14	New York, NY	Yeshiva University Visit	1,887	304	153	440	-	2,783	-	-	-	2,783	100001-73400 101001-73400
5/19/14	5/20/14	5/29/14	Nashville, TN	President meeting	-	143	69	-	-	212	-	-	-	212	100001-73100
6/16/14	6/20/14	6/5/14	Washington, DC and Nashville, TN	Meeting with Gallop; STEM Council Meeting; TBR Qtrly meeting	449	873	200	328	-	1,850	-	-	-	1,850	100001-73400
<b>Total Travel Expenses by the President</b>					<b>\$ 3,466</b>	<b>\$ 4,568</b>	<b>\$ 1,638</b>	<b>\$ 2,261</b>		<b>\$ 11,934</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 11,934</b>	
8/13/13	8/13/13	8/22/13	Nashville, TN	THEC office for meeting at the direction of President	132	-	-	-	-	132	-	-	-	132	100001-73100
9/3/13	9/3/13	9/12/13	Knoxville, TN	Lunch meeting with House Education Committee Chairman	106	-	-	-	-	106	-	-	-	106	100001-73900
2/28/14	3/5/14	2/27/14	Anaheim, CA	Community College Baccalaureate Assn Conf Advancing the Completion Agenda/Innovations 2014	602	281	349	450	-	1,681	-	-	-	1,681	100001-73200
3/12/14	3/12/14	3/20/14	Nashville, TN	TBR Office Meeting	136	-	-	-	-	136	-	-	-	136	100001-73900
<b>Travel Expenses at the request of the President - Oscar Brock, Community Devel. Officer</b>					<b>\$ 976</b>	<b>\$ 281</b>	<b>\$ 349</b>	<b>\$ 450</b>		<b>\$ 2,055</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 2,055</b>	
12/4/13	12/5/13	12/19/13	Nashville, TN	Holiday Party gathering at Vice Chancellor's residence and TBR Quarterly Meeting	-	95	-	-	-	-	-	95	-	95	100001-73300 101001-73300
12/28/13	1/13/14	1/3/14	Barbados	Working with the University of the West Indies	1,652	-	-	39	-	-	-	1,691	-	1,691	110001-101001-73200
3/1/14	3/5/14	3/18/14	Anaheim, CA	League for Innovation 2014, Presentation of SAILS	394	-	320	-	B	-	-	714	-	714	100001-73400 101001-73400
4/1/14	4/8/14	2/27/14	Washington, DC	HERDI 2014 Conf & AACC 2014 Conference	245	1,122	266	515	-	-	-	2,148	-	2,148	100001-73200 101001-73200
4/15/14	4/17/14	4/24/14	Boston, MA	Ed Online discuss future strategies	-	262	179	140	C	-	-	580	-	580	100001-73400 101001-73400
5/13/14	5/14/14	5/6/14	New York, NY	Yeshiva University Visit	958	304	153	37	-	-	-	1,451	-	1,451	100001-73400 101001-73400
6/16/14	6/20/14	6/5/14	Washington, DC and Nashville, TN	Meeting with Gallop; STEM Council Meeting; TBR Qtrly meeting	585	873	200	-	-	1,658	-	-	-	1,658	100001-73400
<b>Travel Expenses at the request of the President - Lisa Haynes, Chief Innovations Officer</b>					<b>\$ 3,833</b>	<b>\$ 2,656</b>	<b>\$ 1,116</b>	<b>\$ 731</b>		<b>\$ 1,658</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 6,677</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 8,335</b>	
1/26/14	1/28/14	3/11/14	Orlando, FL	2014 Futures Assembly, Bellweather Presentation for SAILS	321	236	-	495	-	321	236	495	-	1,052	100001-73200 101001-73200
<b>Travel Expenses at the request of the President - Regent Tom Griscom</b>					<b>\$ 321</b>	<b>\$ 236</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 495</b>		<b>\$ 321</b>	<b>\$ 236</b>	<b>\$ 495</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 1,052</b>	
<b>Total Travel Expenses at the request of the President</b>					<b>\$ 5,129</b>	<b>\$ 3,173</b>	<b>\$ 1,465</b>	<b>\$ 1,676</b>		<b>\$ 4,034</b>	<b>\$ 236</b>	<b>\$ 7,172</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 11,442</b>	
<b>Total Travel Expenses for the President</b>					<b>\$ 8,595</b>	<b>\$ 7,741</b>	<b>\$ 3,103</b>	<b>\$ 3,937</b>		<b>\$ 15,967</b>	<b>\$ 236</b>	<b>\$ 7,172</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 23,376</b>	

Note A - This trip was subsequently cancelled. The airfare was booked using a travel agency. When the airfare was cancelled, the travel agency charged a \$200 flight change fee and a \$25 fee for the original ticket.  
Note B - College was provided some complimentary rooms by the sponsor; one of the rooms was used by this employee.  
Note B - Educate Online paid airfare.

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule B - Business Meals & Hospitality Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Event Date	Date Paid	Payee	Description of Event	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Number of Attendees	\$/Person	Organization & Account Code
				Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation					
7/1/13	12/18/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Various - President's Office Guest	94	-	-	-	-	94	NA	\$ 94.00	100001-74980
7/2/13	7/17/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss training partnership opportunities with McKee Foods	151	-	-	-	-	151	9	\$ 16.72	100001-74980
7/9/13	7/23/13	James L. Catanzaro	Share design features of ChSCC & UTK programs for the "First-of-Family" to attend College	81	-	-	-	-	81	4	\$ 20.29	100001-74980
7/10/13	7/23/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss possible positions at the College	57	-	-	-	-	57	2	\$ 28.71	100001-74980
Various	7/11/13	The Walden Club	Annual Dues				1,140		1,140	na	na	1050-74480
7/11/13	7/17/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Search committee conducting interviews for position of Associate Vice President of Leadership & Fund Development	37	-	-	-	-	37	7	\$ 5.29	100001-74980
7/11/13	8/6/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss employment at Chattanooga State	90	-	-	-	-	90	2	\$ 45.12	100001-74980
7/11/13	10/28/13	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guest	-	15	-	-	-	15	1	\$ 15.00	1020-74980
7/12/13	7/17/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Search committee conducting interviews for position of Associate Vice President of Leadership & Fund Development	37	-	-	-	-	37	7	\$ 5.29	100001-74980
7/12/13	8/6/13	James L. Catanzaro	Conduct an exit interview of a candidate	27	-	-	-	-	27	2	\$ 13.26	100001-74980
7/12/13	7/23/13	James L. Catanzaro	Review Associate VP Candidate interview and discuss immigration, relocation, & compensation.	101	-	-	-	-	101	2	\$ 50.66	100001-74980
7/12/13	7/23/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss with a job applicant potential roles with the College	58	-	-	-	-	58	2	\$ 29.10	100001-74980
7/13/13	7/23/13	James L. Catanzaro	Breakfast on way to airport to finalize potential work with the College	36	-	-	-	-	36	2	\$ 17.96	100001-74980
7/17/13	8/6/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss a partnership in high school recruiting	29	-	-	-	-	29	2	\$ 14.29	100001-74980
7/19/13	8/6/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss SGA & the student paper for 2013-2014	35	-	-	-	-	35	4	\$ 8.71	100001-74980
7/25/13	7/31/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Meeting with Dynamic Campus	21	-	-	-	-	21	9	\$ 2.33	100001-74980
7/30/13	7/31/13	CHSCC - Food Services	College Branding Task Force Luncheon	185	-	-	-	-	185	10	\$ 18.54	100001-74980
8/1/13	9/3/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss the Student Government Association's plans for fall 2013	69	-	-	-	-	69	5	\$ 13.85	100001-74980
8/12/13	8/14/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Economic Roundtable	257	-	-	-	-	257	18	\$ 14.28	100001-74980
8/14/13	8/21/13	CHSCC - Food Services	College Branding Task Force Luncheon	275	-	-	-	-	275	9	\$ 30.52	100001-74980
8/16/13	8/13/13	Chattanooga Convention and Visitors	Annual meeting with Chattanooga Visitor's Bureau	-	-	38	-	-	38	1	\$ 37.50	100002-74980

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule B - Business Meals & Hospitality Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Event Date	Date Paid	Payee	Description of Event	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Number of Attendees	\$/Person	Organization & Account Code
				Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation					
8/26/13	8/31/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Guests from Yeshiva University located in NY visited campus to focus on our online learning and tour VW Academy	129	-	-	-	-	129	9	\$ 14.28	
8/27/13	8/31/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Visit of campus and VW Academy by new UTC Chancellor	35	-	-	-	-	35	2	\$ 17.45	100001-74980
8/28/13	9/12/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss Wacker and Chattanooga State's future direction	56	-	-	-	-	56	2	\$ 28.04	100001-74980
8/30/13	9/12/13	James L. Catanzaro	Coordinate student leader activities for retention	59	-	-	-	-	59	4	\$ 14.80	100001-74980
9/5/13	9/17/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss faculty workshop regarding student retention for convocation.	66	-	-	-	-	66	2	\$ 33.20	100001-74980
9/6/13	9/12/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Panel meeting with Students from the League for Innovations. Focus was "Student Success"	253	-	-	-	-	253	14	\$ 18.09	100001-74980
9/6/13	9/17/13	James L. Catanzaro	Bring together SGA & Student Tour Leaders with consultant to enhance student life	54	-	-	-	-	54	4	\$ 13.40	100001-74980
9/11/13	11/19/13	The Walden Club	Member Social Reception	-	30	-	-	-	30	1	\$ 30.00	1020-74980
9/13/13	9/25/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Honors College Network meeting	25	-	-	-	-	25	6	\$ 4.17	100001-74980
9/13/13	10/1/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss campus tours, SGA Leadership development	54	-	-	-	-	54	4	\$ 13.40	100001-74980
9/13/13	10/1/13	James L. Catanzaro	Close out College within a College leadership for effective pass on to new director	54	-	-	-	-	54	2	\$ 27.22	100001-74980
9/16/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss Maxine Smith Fellows Program	36	-	-	-	-	36	2	\$ 18.01	100001-74980
9/17/13	10/1/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss VW Academy contract terms	52	-	-	-	-	52	2	\$ 25.80	100001-74980
9/24/13	10/9/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss possibility of Chattanooga State students engaging in internships at Sovee and to offer some instruction in new technology if interested.	139	-	-	-	-	139	9	\$ 15.45	100001-74980
9/26/13	10/9/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss SCORE and Chatt State initiatives to accelerate learning and completion	23	-	-	-	-	23	5	\$ 4.60	100001-74980
9/27/13	10/9/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Event to gauge the interest in an Accelerator set here at the Campus of Chattanooga State Community College	133	-	-	-	-	133	52	\$ 2.56	100001-74980
10/1/13	10/3/13	Executive Women International	Business Meeting	-	-	-	20	-	20	1	\$ 20.00	1050-74980
10/4/13	10/9/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss corporate training options for Vision Hospitality Group	12	-	-	-	-	12	6	\$ 2.00	100001-74980
10/4/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss new academic year focus	90	-	-	-	-	90	6	\$ 15.03	100001-74980

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule B - Business Meals & Hospitality Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Event Date	Date Paid	Payee	Description of Event	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Number of Attendees	\$/Person	Organization & Account Code
				Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation					
10/7/13	10/9/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Meeting of the Branding Task Force, continuing our intensive discussion of such large issues as the college's mission, brand, name, programs, corporate partnerships, financial support, and national standing. Focus on state initiatives, developing educational relationship, and brainstorming.	259	-	-	-	-	259	16	\$ 16.20	
10/8/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss United Way Campaign and Employment opportunities at CHSCC	38	-	-	-	-	38	2	\$ 18.98	100001-74980
10/11/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss 2013-14 Student Government	57	-	-	-	-	57	4	\$ 14.20	100001-74980
10/18/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Plan SGA participation in recruitment support for athletics	61	-	-	-	-	61	4	\$ 15.18	100001-74980
10/25/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss support for Student Government Association	39	-	-	-	-	39	3	\$ 12.83	100001-74980
10/28/13	11/7/13	James L. Catanzaro	Candidate for training and accounting position	46	-	-	-	-	46	2	\$ 22.92	100001-74980
11/4/13	11/7/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Campus tour and partnership discussion with Chattem	61	-	-	-	-	61	4	\$ 15.20	100001-74980
11/8/13	11/20/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Cyanetix Group presentation regarding consulting proposal	136	-	-	-	-	136	8	\$ 16.95	100001-74980
11/15/13	12/19/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss student issues with SGA Leaders	70	-	-	-	-	70	5	\$ 14.02	100001-74980
11/18/13	11/20/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Hospitality Institute meeting to discuss curriculum	13	-	-	-	-	13	10	\$ 1.30	100001-74980
11/18/13	12/10/13	Chattanooga State	Funders Forum Luncheon	-	-	-	12	-	12	1	\$ 11.56	1050-74980
11/22/13	12/19/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss entrepreneurship & student initiatives	116	-	-	-	-	116	8	\$ 14.52	100001-74980
11/22/13	12/17/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss future partnership opportunities, corporate/college	113	-	-	-	-	113	4	\$ 28.31	100001-74980
11/25/13	12/17/13	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss potential teaching opportunity at CHSCC and helping with training on Barbados operation	149	-	-	-	-	149	4	\$ 37.22	100001-74980
11/26/13	12/17/13	James L. Catanzaro	Work out three (3) major agreements with Superintendent of HCDE	95	-	-	-	-	95	5	\$ 19.06	100001-74980
12/11/13	12/11/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Host luncheon with TBR Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs. Introduction of new Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs and discussed Chatt State programs and our vision for the future	312	-	-	-	-	312	18	\$ 17.31	100001-74980
12/17/13	12/18/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Legislative Delegation Luncheon	246	-	-	-	-	246	10	\$ 24.62	100001-74980
12/19/13	12/18/13	CHSCC - Food Services	Campus tour and partnership discussion with UTC	70	-	-	-	-	70	5	\$ 14.05	100001-74980
1/1/14	2/19/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guests	-	75	-	-	-	75	5	\$ 15.00	1020-74980

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule B - Business Meals & Hospitality Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Event Date	Date Paid	Payee	Description of Event	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Number of Attendees	\$/Person	Organization & Account Code
				Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation					
1/7/14	4/15/14	James L. Catanzaro	Chatt State/Barbados on line classes student exchange	121					121	3	\$ 40.48	100001-74980
1/14/14	1/15/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Welcome to campus for convocation guest speaker	47	-	-	-	-	47	4	\$ 11.74	100001-74980
1/17/14	4/15/14	James L. Catanzaro	SGA - Student Issues	69					69	5	\$ 13.74	100001-74980
1/23/14	1/24/14	Bluff View Art District	Dinner with Guest Speaker	-	-	-	90	-	90	2	\$ 45.14	1020-74980
1/31/14	4/15/14	James L. Catanzaro	Conference Planning Wacker Institute	67	-	-	-	-	67	3	\$ 22.31	100001-74980
2/1/14	2/19/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guest	-	15	-	-	-	15	1	\$ 15.00	1050-74980
2/6/14	4/18/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guest	-	15	-	-	-	15	1	\$ 15.00	1020-74980
2/7/14	2/12/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Welcome to new Cleveland State Comm College President with tour	59	-	-	-	-	59	6	\$ 9.91	100001-74980
2/10/14	2/12/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Presentation: "Support Needs of Advanced Technology Start-ups"	75	-	-	-	-	75	6	\$ 12.49	100001-74980
2/14/14	2/20/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss upcoming campus initiatives	63	-	-	-	-	63	5	\$ 12.69	100001-74980
2/17/14	2/20/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Luncheon and campus tour with FSB Bank Officers to discuss partnership	81	-	-	-	-	81	5	\$ 16.15	100001-74980
2/21/14	4/8/14	James L. Catanzaro	Ask individual to join ChSCC Fnd Board and introduce to Summer insitute Initiative	81	-	-	-	-	81	4	\$ 20.19	100001-74980
2/21/14	4/15/14	James L. Catanzaro	Foundation Board Fund Raising	80	-	-	-	-	80	4	\$ 19.94	100001-74980
2/21/14	4/15/14	James L. Catanzaro	SGA - Student Issues	107	-	-	-	-	107	7	\$ 15.33	100001-74980
3/6/14	3/12/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Co-Lab staff to meet with Innovations team and faculty to discuss partnership and GigCiith 2014	100	-	-	-	-	100	7	\$ 14.31	100001-74980
3/14/14	4/8/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss "Angel" investment in college, innovations, and initiatives	68	-	-	-	-	68	3	\$ 22.63	100001-74980
3/14/14	4/8/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss SGA activities and enlist support for Spring College events	76	-	-	-	-	76	5	\$ 15.16	100001-74980
3/20/14	4/18/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guests	-	30	-	-	-	30	2	\$ 15.00	1020-74980
3/20/14	4/18/14	James L. Catanzaro	Seek assistance in fund development for new college initiatives	61	-	-	-	-	61	4	\$ 15.25	100001-74980
3/24/14	4/8/14	James L. Catanzaro	Introduce 2014 Maxine Smith Fellow mentee to college diversity leaders; discuss minority recruitment	127	-	-	-	-	127	4	\$ 31.79	100001-74980
3/25/14	4/8/14	James L. Catanzaro	Plan student leaders' last month and prep for 50th anniversary	113	-	-	-	-	113	8	\$ 14.13	100001-74980
3/25/14	4/8/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss reverse transfer, joint recruitment initiatives ChSCC and TSU	116	-	-	-	-	116	5	\$ 23.10	100001-74980
3/26/14	3/11/14	Urban League of Greater Chattanooga	2014 Entrepreneur Power Luncheon-Company Table purchase	-	-	600	-	-	600	10	\$ 60.00	100002-74980

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule B - Business Meals & Hospitality Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Event Date	Date Paid	Payee	Description of Event	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Number of Attendees	\$/Person	Organization & Account Code
				Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation					
4/21/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Mentoring of current and former Maxine Smith Fellowsmenetees	63	-	-	-	-	63	4	\$ 15.78	100001-74980
4/22/14	4/24/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss Pediatric Healthcare Improvement Coalition for the Tenn Valley	23	-	-	-	-	23	4	\$ 5.75	100001-74980
4/24/14	4/29/14	CHSCC - Food Services	ITHAKA Group Interviews for the Higher Ed Social Network mapping project	24	-	-	-	-	24	7	\$ 3.42	100001-74980
4/29/14	4/30/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Quarterly meeting of Foundation Board	286	-	-	-	-	286	17	\$ 16.80	100001-74980
5/2/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	End of year Student Leader meeting to give ChSCC President feedback and discuss "Future Giving" campaign	155	-	-	-	-	155	11	\$ 14.05	100001-74980
5/2/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Interview perspective new hire for college	71	-	-	-	-	71	5	\$ 14.13	100001-74980
5/7/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss BAS degrees	94	-	-	-	-	94	3	\$ 31.25	100001-74980
5/9/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Softball team celebration for making the NJCAA Softball National Tournament	366	-	-	-	-	366	23	\$ 15.92	100001-74980
5/10/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Commencement luncheon with Guest Speaker	145	-	-	-	-	145	8	\$ 18.10	100001-74980
5/20/14	6/30/14	Chattanooga State	Dinner guest at SAILS grant meeting	-	48	-	-	-	48	1	\$ 48.00	1020-74980
5/22/14	5/30/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss campus initiatives (Gallup Institute, etc)	26	-	-	-	-	26	5	\$ 5.10	100001-74980
5/23/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss development of Continuing Education real estate sector	34	-	-	-	-	34	3	\$ 11.32	100001-74980
5/27/14	5/30/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Lunch with Provost Applicant	132	-	-	-	-	132	12	\$ 10.99	100001-74980
5/27/14	5/30/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Meet with Provost Applicant	23	-	-	-	-	23	3	\$ 7.66	100001-74980
5/29/14	6/6/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Lunch with Provost Applicant	132	-	-	-	-	132	12	\$ 10.99	100001-74980
5/29/14	6/6/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Meet with Provost Applicant	23	-	-	-	-	23	3	\$ 7.66	100001-74980
5/29/14	7/15/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guest	-	15	-	-	-	15	1	\$ 15.00	1020-74980
6/3/14	6/13/14	CHSCC - Food Services	TN Valley Corridor Summit	150	-	-	-	-	150	50	\$ 3.00	100001-74980
6/10/14	6/13/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Meeting with Tucker Foundation to discuss "TN Promise" and the impact it will have on funding for scholarships	59	-	-	-	-	59	5	\$ 11.75	100001-74980
6/12/14	6/13/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Meeting with Pediatric Medical Group	21	-	-	-	-	21	3	\$ 7.00	100001-74980
6/12/14	7/15/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guest	-	15	-	-	-	15	1	\$ 15.00	1020-74980
6/13/14	6/27/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss TBR Board matters	24	-	-	-	-	24	2	\$ 12.11	100001-74980
6/13/14	6/30/14	The Walden Club	Athletic Hall of Fame	-	84	-	-	-	84	2	\$ 42.00	1020-74980
6/16/14	6/23/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Discuss TN Promis/TN Achieves	83	-	-	-	-	83	24	\$ 3.44	100001-74980
6/25/14	6/27/14	CHSCC Food Service	Meeting with THEC to discuss TN Promise	117	-	-	-	-	117	5	\$ 23.33	100001-74980
6/26/14	6/30/14	James L. Catanzaro	Discuss collaboration between college and Project Lift with college acelorator	53	-	-	-	-	53	3	\$ 17.78	100001-74980
6/26/14	7/15/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Luncheon Guest	-	15	-	-	-	15	1	\$ 15.00	1020-74980
6/30/14	6/30/14	Jewish Federation of Greater Chattanooga	Catered Glatt Kosher Meals for the Yeshiva University Vist	260	-	-	-	-	260	26	\$ 10.00	100001-74980
Various	5/29/14	CHSCC - Food Services	Coffee - Wednesday Meetings	300	-	-	-	-	300	NA	\$ 300.00	100001-74980
Various	6/27/14	CHSCC Food Service	President's office guest	92	-	-	-	-	92	NA	\$ 92.00	100001-74980
<b>Total Business Meals and Hospitality Expenses for the President</b>				<b>\$ 9,054</b>	<b>\$ 357</b>	<b>\$ 638</b>	<b>\$ 1,262</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 11,310</b>			

**Chattanooga State Community College**  
**Schedule C - Other Expenses for the President**  
**For the Period July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014**

Date Paid	Payee	Description	President's Budgetary Accounts		Other Accounts		External Sources	Total	Organization & Account Code
			Institutional	Foundation	Institutional	Foundation			
7/9/13	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Quarterly dues	-	225	-	-	-	225	1020-74480
7/23/13	BP	Fuel	287	-	-	-	-	287	100001-75210
8/13/13	Village VW of Chattanooga	Vehicle Maintenance	-	-	476	-	-	476	303004-75290
8/20/13	BP	Fuel	427	-	-	-	-	427	100001-75210
8/20/13	Shell	Fuel	17	-	-	-	-	17	100001-75210
8/20/13	BP	Fuel	309	-	-	-	-	309	100001-75210
8/20/13	BP	Fuel	239	-	-	-	-	239	100001-75210
9/21/13	BP	Fuel	439	-	-	-	-	439	100001-75210
9/21/13	BP	Fuel	309	-	-	-	-	309	100001-75210
9/30/13	Century Link	Land line phone calls made from President's phone for 1st quarter (Jul13 - Aug13)	-	-	10	-	-	10	300301-74220
10/17/13	Shell	Fuel	56	-	-	-	-	56	100001-75210
10/21/13	BP	Fuel	356	-	-	-	-	356	100001-75210
10/28/13	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Quarterly dues	-	225	-	-	-	225	1020-74480
11/14/13	Shell	Fuel	36	-	-	-	-	36	100001-75210
11/19/13	BP	Fuel	238	-	-	-	-	238	100001-75210
11/21/13	Highland Tire and Auto	Vehicle Maintenance	-	-	18	-	-	18	303004-75220
12/11/13	Village VW of Chattanooga	Vehicle Maintenance	-	-	720	-	-	720	303004-74390
12/11/13	O'Reilly's Auto Parts	Vehicle Maintenance	-	-	167	-	-	167	303004-74530
12/13/13	Mountain View Nissan	New Vehicle	-	-	13,500	-	-	13,500	802101-78120
12/17/13	BP	Fuel	354	-	-	-	-	354	100001-75210
12/17/13	Shell	Fuel	35	-	-	-	-	35	100001-75210
12/19/13	Ensign Florist	Floral arrangement for Memorial	-	120	-	-	-	120	1020-74980
12/23/13	Village VW of Chattanooga	Refund Vehicle Maintenance	-	-	(274)	-	-	(274)	303004-74390
12/31/13	Century Link	Land line phone calls made from President's phone for 2nd quarter (Sep13-Nov13)	-	-	40	-	-	40	300301-74220
1/13/14	Chattanooga State	Cystic Fibrosis Brochure Printing	-	438	-	-	-	438	1020-74980
1/27/14	Best Buy	Laptop	-	-	2,620	-	-	2,620	802101-74510
2/19/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Quarterly dues	-	225	-	-	-	225	1020-74480
3/31/14	Century Link	Land line phone calls made from President's phone for 3rd quarter (Dec13-Mar14)	-	-	16	-	-	16	300301-74220
4/10/14	Shell	Fuel	54	-	-	-	-	54	100001-75210
4/17/14	BP	Fuel	245	-	-	-	-	245	100001-75210
4/18/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Quarterly dues	-	225	-	-	-	225	1020-74480
4/18/14	Rotary Club of Chattanooga	Special event assessment Paul A. McDaniel Golf Classic sponsorship	-	75	-	-	-	75	1020-74480
5/2/14	Sigma Pi Phi	Nissan Murano Windshield	-	500	-	-	-	500	1020-74980
5/13/14	Safelite Auto Glass	Repair	-	-	347	-	-	347	1020-74980
5/13/14	Shell	Fuel	83	-	-	-	-	83	100001-75210
5/15/14	BP	Fuel	250	-	-	-	-	250	100001-75210
6/17/14	BP	Fuel	294	-	-	-	-	294	100001-75210
6/17/14	BP	Fuel	47	-	-	-	-	47	100001-75210
6/30/14	Century Link	Land line phone calls made from President's phone for 4th quarter	-	-	5	-	-	5	300301-74220
6/30/14	BP	Fuel	192	-	-	-	-	192	100001-75210
<b>Total Other Operating Expenses for the President</b>			<b>\$ 4,269</b>	<b>\$ 2,033</b>	<b>\$ 17,646</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 23,947</b>	